UNDP PROJECT Modern Parliament for Modern Armenia (MAP)

Parliamentary Education Unit (PEU) of the National Assembly of the Republic of Armenia

Analysis on the Concept and Structure (draft)

By

EURASIA PARTNERSHIP FOUNDATION

Concept development team		
Team leader/expert	Lusine Kharatyan	
Senior Expert	Vahram Soghomonyan	
Quality Assurance Manager	Gevorg Ter-Gabrielyan	
Project Manager	Mikayel Hovhannisyan	
Project Associate	Julya Sahakyan	

DRAFT

Contents

I.	Executive Summary	4
II.	Introduction: The need for the NA Parliamentary Education Unit	5
III.	Concept Development Methodology	7
IV.	Findings of the local needs assessment	10
4	.1. Goals and objectives of the RA NA Parliamentary Education Unit (PEU)	10
4	.2. Target groups of the PEU's educational programs	12
4	.3. Content and thematic framework of the PEU's educational programs	12
	.4. Parliamentary Education Unit structure and functions, engagement of members of the arliament, relations with other civic education institutions, and sustainability	14
V. I	Parliamentary education in other countries	17
	.1. Educational programs, their content and thematic framework, target groups, ways and nethods of implementation	17
	5.1.1. Implemented educational programs, their content and thematic framewor	
	5.1.2. Target groups and engagement methods	22
	.2. Organizational and institutional structure, staff and legal status, funding sources and ustainability	23
VI.	Concept for the RA NA Parliamentary Education Unit	26
6	.1. Mission, goal, and objectives of the Parliamentary Education Unit of the RA NA	26
6	.2. Parliamentary Education Unit target groups and potential educational programs	26
6	.3. Content/thematic framework of the PEU's's programs	30
6	.4. Where to start from? Scenario/option selection	37
6	.5. Structure and functions of the Parliamentary Education Unit	39
6	.6. Types of Activities	40
6	.7. Ensuring Sustainability	41
VII	Conclusions	43
VII	I. Annexes	46

List of Abbreviations

EPF Eurasia Partnership Foundation FRG Federal Republic of Germany

Local Self-government LSG

Modern Parliament for Modern Armenia MAP

Ministry of Education, Science, Culture and Sport MoESCS

NA National Assembly

Non-governmental organization NGO National Institute of Education **NIE** United States of America USA RA Republic of Armenia

RA NA PEU Parliamentary Education Unit of the National Assembly of the Republic of

Armenia

SD Sustainable development

SNCO State non-commercial organization

United Kingdom UK **United Nations** UN

United Nations Development Program **UNDP**

United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization UNESCO

I. Executive Summary

This report presents the Concept for the Parliamentary Education Unit of the National Assembly of the Republic of Armenia (RA NA PEU). The proposed Concept was developed by a team of Eurasia Partnership Foundation (EPF), based on the Armenian needs assessment and the study of international experience carried out in July 2020-January 2021, and was commissioned by the UNDP MAP Project.

The Assignment was intended to support the establishment of a working group bringing together experts specialized in civic education in order to discuss and develop the concept, structure and workplan of the PEU, methodology, curricula and training modules for the civic education programme amongst the youth in high schools and universities, with a focus on promotion of interest, awareness and knowledge of the parliamentary culture and engagement with the parliament.

The Concept was developed based on the following approach and methodology:

- Local needs assessment and identification of the needs and expectations of key stakeholders (RA NA, UNDP MAP, RA MoESCS) and beneficiaries (pupils, students, teachers);
- Study and analysis of the international experience of Parliamentary Civic Education in a number of selected countries to adapt and apply best practices in the Armenian context and to learn from their lessons;
- Desk review of relevant legal and institutional framework for the development of appropriate and relevant structure and content.

Data analysis is based on the synthesis and triangulation of information obtained from these three activities. Due to Covid-19 restrictions and later the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict escalation in autumn 2020, the data collection was restricted.

The presented report is structured around the following five main sections:

- (a) **Introduction**, which focuses on the need for the parliamentary civic education;
- (b) **Methodology**, which presents the overall approach to data collection and analysis;
- (c) **Findings of the Local Needs Assessment**, where the results of the qualitative semistructured interviews and focus groups with different stakeholder groups in Armenia are presented;
- (d) **International Experience**, which presents the relevant experience of selected countries in parliamentary education; and finally
- (e) The proposed **Concept for the RA NA Parliamentary Education Unit**, which proposes the mission, goals and objectives, target groups and educational content/curriculum, possible institutional structure and setup, as well as sustainability, based on the information and analysis presented in the previous sections.

II. Introduction: The need for the NA Parliamentary Education Unit

In the modern world, great attention is attached to civic education both nationally and globally. In general, civic education or education of citizens, or as it is sometimes called, democratic education, is a mandatory component of democratic societies. According to the Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy, in its broadest definition, "civic education" means all the educational processes that affect people's beliefs, commitments, capabilities, and actions as members or prospective members of communities.¹ In general, such education provides citizens with the information, skills, and educational experience necessary to engage in democratic processes.²

The overall goal of civic education is to promote civic engagement and support democratic and participatory governance.³ Civic education consists of three main components - **knowledge**, **skills and attitude**. First of the components - **knowledge**, refers to citizens' understanding of the workings of the political system, as well as of their own political and civic rights and responsibilities (e.g. freedom of speech, the right to vote and to stand for election, respect for the rule of law and the rights of others). The second component - **civic skills**, refers to the ability of citizens to analyze and evaluate public issues, and defend their positions, as well as the ability to use their knowledge to participate in civic and political processes (e.g. to monitor government performance, or mobilize other citizens around particular issues). **Civic attitude** is defined as the citizen traits necessary for a democracy (e.g. tolerance, civility, critical thinking, willingness to listen, negotiate and compromise).⁴

In the Republic of Armenia, various civic education programs have commenced since Armenia's independence. Initially these were mainly non-formal education programs (trainings, seminars) aimed at young people and especially students, and were implemented by international and later by local NGOs. The main goal of these programs was to introduce basic values and ideas of democracy to post-Soviet Armenia, as well as to form a participatory culture. Over the years, these programs have evolved to include a wider range of civic knowledge, skills, and attitudes - from holding elections, participation, to skills necessary for monitoring government performance, and conflict resolution.

Civic education entered the formal education system of Armenia much later. The need for civic education and its main content are defined in the RA Law on Education and RA Law on General Education and the documents deriving thereof, where it is part of the national education. In particular, Article 5 of the RA Law on Education mentions the formation of civic consciousness as one of the objectives of the state in the field of education, and Article 18, which deals with general education, states, among other goals, "the formation of a person as a future citizen", and mentions as one of the main objectives "the formation of an individual and a citizen who partakes in universal and national values, bears national cultural and moral- psychological heritage and has an active civic position". The RA Law on General Education further strengthens these provisions by stipulating in Article 5 that in the field of general education the state guarantees in particular "the importance of civic consciousness, respect for the individual and his/her rights, tolerance, formation of ecological worldview" and so on.

¹Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy, Article on Civic Education (first published in 2007,revised in 2018); https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/civic-education/

² Rietbergen-McCracken, J. (2012); Civic Education Toolkit;

https://www.civicus.org/documents/toolkits/PGX B Civic%20Education.pdf>

³ Ibid.

⁴ Ibid.

Various subjects related to civic education have been taught in the Armenian public schools since 1999: "Human Rights" in the 8th grade, "Civic Education" in the 9th grade, "Theory of State and Law" in the 10th grade. Moreover, since 2007 all these have been replaced by the subject "Social Science," within which formal civic education is mainly implemented. Teaching the subject begins in the upper grades of the middle school and continues in high school. However, while some sporadic visits to Parliament and meetings with MPs are organized within this subject area by some schools, parliamentary civic education as a structured, regular and institutionalized undertaking has never been a part of civic education in Armenia.

At the same time, despite the existence of many non-formal programs, as well as the introduction of civic education in the formal education system, democratization of the Armenian society, as in most post-Soviet countries, is a very slow process. There are many obstacles in this regard, among which the soviet heritage and its top-down governance and one-party system, which did not encourage pluralism and participation, as well as people's lack of democratic/civic knowledge and skills and the resulting misconceptions and attitudes.

Since 2018, the newly elected National Assembly of the Republic Armenia among other objectives, confers importance to the education of citizens in the process of strengthening participatory democracy. The National Assembly prioritizes the establishment of a Center for Parliamentary Democracy, consisting of three components: i) Visitor Center designed to facilitate the access of citizens to the NA and their meetings with MPs; ii) Information and Outreach Center designed to increase the interest and awareness of the parliamentary culture amongst a wide range of visitors; iii) Parliamentary Education Unit (PEU) designed to promote civic education amongst the youth.

The concept presented in this paper provides the basic structure and content for the RA NA Parliamentary Education Unit (PEU).

-

⁵ This idea has been expressed in numerus speeches and interviews of MPs, as well as in the interviews conducted within our research.

III. Concept Development Methodology

The proposed Concept is based on the information collected and analyzed through the methods presented below.

- (a) *Local needs assessment* and identification of needs and expectations of key stakeholders (RA NA, UNDP, RA MoESCS) and beneficiaries (pupils, students, teachers), including:
 - Individual and group interviews using a semi-structured qualitative interview guide with
 the members of the NA; relevant staff of the RA MOESCS and its structures, such as the
 Department of General Education, RA Education Inspectorate, the dissolved National
 Institute of Education; civil society organizations implementing civic education programs;
 as well as experts in the field.

In total, 25 semi-structured interviews were conducted with the experts developing the new state standard for general education, representatives of educational organizations, members of the RA NA, members of Yerevan Council of Elders in charge of general education, and social science researchers/experts, which were recorded and later transcribed. The list of respondents and the interview guides are attached as **Annex 1** and **Annex 2**, respectively.

• Focus group discussions with teachers of Social Science in the public schools, pupils of upper middle school and high school, as well as students of different universities of Armenia. On-line focus groups were organized. To ensure representativeness as much as possible, the focus groups included pupils, students and teachers residing, working and/or studying in rural and urban communities in different regions of Armenia. Apart from the focus group with students, where the respondents were only women,⁶ in the other groups equal gender representation was ensured. Overall, four focus groups were organized with the following targets respectively: (a) pupils of higher grades of middle schools, (b) high school students, (c) students from universities in different regions of Armenia, and (d) Social Science teachers at schools in rural and urban communities of different regions of Armenia.

In total, 35 people participated in the focus group discussions. The focus group guide is presented in the **Annex 2**.

- (b) *Study of the international experience* to adapt and apply best practices in the Armenian context and to learn from the lessons learnt, including:
 - **Desk Research:** Study of online resources, information, and materials of the educational centers and/or programs of parliaments of a number of Western countries. Countries with both continental and common, as well as mixed legal systems were covered by the study. It included the programs of such centers/programs in the United States, Germany, United Kingdom, Canada, Scotland, and Sweden. The links and references to the Internet resources/websites studied are presented in **Annex 3**.

7

⁶ The invitation was sent without gender discrimination to equal number of men and women, however, only women participated.

- Online interviews: Qualitative interviews with the heads of educational programs/centers of a number of parliaments with successful experience in implementing educational programs. Online interviews were conducted with the educational program officers of the parliaments of Germany, Canada, the United Kingdom and Sweden. To better understand the German civic education model, the questionnaire was also sent to the head of the Civic Education Center in the state of Saxony-Anhalt. The list of interviewees and the interview guide are attached as Annex 4 and Annex 5, respectively.
- (c) **Desk review of relevant legal and institutional framework**, focusing on the new state standard for the subject of "Social Science."⁷

The table below presents the sample of the local needs assessment.

Table 1. Sampling for needs assessment				
Respondent	Method	Number of interviews and FGs	Number of respondents	Implementation period
Members of the RA NA (MPs)	Semi-structured interview	5	5	July 2020
RA MOESCS and structures constituting part of its system	ructures constituting interview		5	July-August 2020
Authors of the standard for general education	Group interview	1	3	August 2020
Experts	Semi-structured interview	7	8	August 2020
NGO representatives	Semi-structured interview	3	3	August 2020
Representatives of LSG Councils of Elders	Semi-structured interview	2	2^8	August 2020
Teachers of Social Science	Focus group	1	10	December 2020
Pupils of middle school	Focus group	1	8	December 2020
High school students	Focus group	1	7	December 2020
Students	Focus group	1	10	December 2020
TOTAL		27	61	

As the table shows, total of 61 people have participated in the interviews and focus groups conducted for local needs assessment. The interview and focus group guides focused on the following main sections:

- Questions clarifying the goals and objectives of the PEU
- Questions revealing the main target groups of the PEU
- Questions related to the content, topics, and duration of the educational programs

⁷ The draft state standard for general education envisages transition to a system of competency-based education system, where interdisciplinary or key competences are attached importance in parallel with subject-specific competences. The NA Civic Education Center can play a complementary role in the formation of the abovementioned key competences envisaged by the curriculum of general education institutions.

⁸ One of the LSG representatives is represented in two places, because we talked to her both as a representative of an NGO and as a member of the Council of Elders.

• Questions related to the PEU structure

The interview guides are attached as **Annex 2**. In addition to fieldwork to identify the local specific needs, online interviews were also conducted with educational program officers in four (4) foreign parliaments (Germany, Canada, the United Kingdom, and Sweden). The questions included in the interview guides for these interviews (**Annex 5**) consisted of the following main thematic groups:

- Organizational and institutional structure of the unit implementing educational programs
- Educational programs, content and curriculum
- Funding and sustainability

There were some challenges during the implementation of the needs assessment due to the situation with COVID-19 and later with the escalation of the Nagorno Karabakh conflict. This caused delays in receiving responses form the NA MPs, other state officials, as well as focus group participants.

The analysis is based on the synthesis and triangulation of information obtained from the above-described data collection activities.

IV. Findings of the local needs assessment

As stated in the Section III, to identify the needs and expectations of the stakeholders of the RA NA Parliamentary Education Unit, series of interviews and focus group discussions with a total of 61 participants were conducted covering the following topics:

- Goals and objectives of the Parliamentary Education Unit
- Target groups of the PEU's educational programs
- Content and thematic framework of the educational programs
- PEU structure and functions, relations with other civic education institutions
- PEU sustainability

The approaches and ideas recorded regarding these topics are presented below.

4.1. Goals and objectives of the RA NA Parliamentary Education Unit (PEU)

The opinions regarding the goals and objectives of the PEU expressed by the participants of the needs assessment can be summarized in the following key points:

- Provide basic information on Parliament, its role, history, functions, and structure.
- Provide necessary basic hands-on knowledge and practical skills about the legislative process, its stages, procedures, and groups/parties/structures involved.
- Explain the peculiarities of NA-citizen, MP-citizen relations, and communication.
- Develop skills necessary for participation in political and civic life in a democratic system contributing to the formation and establishment of active and proactive citizens.
- Contribute to the formation and development of understanding of the principles, roles, and functions of the branches of government, as well as the formation and development of understanding of the role and functions of the legislature.
- Develop skills for communication with the state governance system, particularly with the legislature.
- Contribute to the establishment of democracy, development of participatory democracy, and enhancement of the role of the citizen through civic education programs.

Excerpts from interviews: Goals and objectives of the NA Parliamentary Education Unit

- As this is a center within the National Assembly, it would be good if it focuses on the NA mandate. The field of broad civic education can be left to other civic education organizations. This center can show why the National Assembly is an institution of participatory democracy, how it contributes to the deepening of participation and its continuity, how it contributes that pluralism is a value item on the agenda, i.e. what constitutes the mandate of the National Assembly and is its natural competence; there is a greater chance that the created products, etc. will be of better quality than if they try to cover the entire field of civic education.

RA NA MP

- Explain to the citizens from school age that the National Assembly is a representative body. A place where people work to solve their [citizens] problems. Also to have them understand which problems are solved there and which are not. Also ways to solve them [the problems]. On the other hand, wider civic education, not only about the National Assembly. There is a perception that the MPs are "the chosen ones," not elected people. Experience shows that it's not the smartest and the sharpest in parliament, rather it is important that different segments of the society are present there. It is a representation by priorities and values.

RA NA MP

- It is an NA center; I suppose that the primary mandate is to teach the students the law-making process and to inform them about its peculiarities, both in the sense of teaching reading the text in terms of content and practical work, program visits and study tours, etc. Regardless of the age target, after receiving the service of that center, that target should have a basic understanding of what stages the law-making process in our country goes through, what procedural things are to be done during those stages. So that the recipient of that service has a global understanding ofhow long it takes to make a law, who are involved, i.e., to have an insight into the entire cycle, not from the school textbooks, but more hands-on and vivid.

 Staff member of a MoESCS entity
- There is a big gap in our country in terms of providing civic education to the general public. Many processes do not move forward because that demanding citizen is missing. [The level of]Participation is also low. The rights, responsibilities and values should largely be provided by that civic education. To be proactively involved and engaged in decision-making at different levels.

MoESCS representative

- To show the journey of Armenian parliamentarianism. For 30 years we have had a rather interesting, unique environment consisting of qualitatively different stages, which has been largely neglected. Also because of political reasons, everyone who comes to power is trying to simply erase the previous one.

 Civic Education Expert
- Ensure more active involvement of citizens in the law-making process and reforms in general. The procedure of the institute of petitions, petition procedure. It is also an opportunity to centralize expert potential in the National Assembly. The educational component must be formed around certain values and principles, which are very popular, well-known things democracy, human rights, participatory democracy, the role of civil society, etc.

RA NA MP

- Rather a resource center, because from an institutional point of view we are talking about the component introduced in the school. Any other educational environment is supportive, since the reform is aimed at making the school an open environment. We can imagine the NA center as an ideological, methodological, value-specific resource center, which can potentially become a center of expertise and an expert examination center for the component of civic education in schools. The structure of general education should be networked, where expert opinions can be implemented not by one, but by different specialized entities. It can also act as a training center and school teachers can be take courses, be trained and keep the civic education component in line with existing approaches. It can also act as a content development center because it is likely be able to develop support materials and resources for the school.

MoESCS representative

- Teacher training should be one of the first goals, to give them certain knowledge and skills, so that if engaging children is not a success, at least it will be compensated by teachers who will gain some experience and communicate it with them. The model of engaging teachers was in Canada in the 1990s, when they realized that they could not bring children to the parliament and pass on that experience, they brought the teachers, trained them in the functions of the parliament, and they were educated at the center both as citizens and civic educators.

Civic Education Expert

Representatives of the RA MoESCS and its subordinated structures expressed opinions close to those of the MPs, but they also added that the Parliamentary Education Unit functioning in the RA NA can fill the gaps of formal education system in terms of civic education by creating necessary resources, developing and implementing educational programs and even conducting expert examination of the educational materials and programs within the scope of its expertise. Meanwhile, education experts and teachers of social science, in addition to the above, believe that the Center's materials should be aligned with textbooks and the school curriculum, thus promoting

the formation of an active and educated citizen, as well as filling the gap in the current curricula with regard to the legislative process and changes. Most of the pupils and students saw the role of the Center more in practical visits and excursions, thanks to which they would get an idea/understanding in situ of how the RA NA works.

4.2. Target groups of the PEU's educational programs

Most participants of the local needs assessment singled out pupils of the upper grades of middle schools, high school students, university students, and social science and history teachers in public schools as the main target of the RA NA Parliamentary Education Unit. However, almost all the respondents stated that with sufficient resources the scope could be expanded to include all age groups, as well as professional or work-associated groups, such as local government representatives, CSOs, representatives of various collegial bodies, and so on.

Excerpts from interviews: Target groups of the NA Parliamentary Education Unit

- The youth, but more specifically, decision-makers in rural communities, condominiums, collegial bodies of hospitals and cultural SNCOs, all those involved in decision-making, universities, schools.

RA Ministry of ESCS Representative

- University students, members of civil society interested in parliamentarianism or human rights, and anyone interested in general.

RA NA MP

- If we distance from general education and consider it also in the context of continuous education, the center can deliver trainings for those adults who can claim to be citizens of the country.

Civic Education Expert

- Primarily starting from middle school, if possible, the university sector as well; as a positive obligation of the state - from middle school to the 12th grade. It is assumed that in case of teachers training they should be licensed.

Staff member of the RA Ministry of ESCS

- It is a matter of resources and enthusiasm, if possible, it can also include retirees. Schoolchildren are still coming. I brought several different groups on my own initiative. The first group should be the age group at school that already studies social science. It starts from the 9th grade, high school for sure. The next one, I am not sure, it could either be a standard tour package for every citizen or any adult visitor, or [anyone of] junior school age. That standard package can be very close to high school, there can be that and something for the little ones. One way or another, in high school they study it a little bit more in detail.

RA NA MP

- Any group can apply and say, "we want training" and the center may organize training as per their needs. But at the same time, tours in the National Assembly, meetings with the members of the Parliament, etc. Or, for example, as a deputy I need volunteers for a project. I get those volunteers from there. Their benefit is that they learn to work with the National Assembly; my benefit is that someone is working for me for free.

RA NA MP

4.3. Content and thematic framework of the PEU's educational programs

According to the participants of the local needs assessment, the **content of the educational programs of the RA NA PEU should focus on the mandate of the RA NA.** The participants of the interviews mainly think that at large, formal and non-formal civic education can be provided by other state and non-state structures, from schools, universities to civil society organizations, whereas, the main scope of the RA NA educational programs should cover the functions, role, and the history of the RA NA. The stakeholders also noted that with focus on

parliamentarianism, participatory democracy, and pluralism, the resources and programs created by the unit would be of much higher quality than if it tries to cover the entire field of civic education. As part of the PEU's educational content and mandatory topics, the following is singled out:

- Three branches of government, principles of their formation, their relationship and the role, structure and functions of the Legislative power, links between the NA and the Government, NA-community, NA-citizen relations, etc.;
- Structure of the RA NA, its functions, procedures, committees, procedure for forming committees, their functions, factions, sittings, etc.;
- Legislative process: how laws are drafted, how the need for legislative regulation arises, who can come up with a legislative initiative, how the legislative process is carried out within the RA NA, who are the main actors, etc.
- Elections and formation of power: political forces and party platforms;
- Theory and history of participatory democracy and the Armenian experience, episodes from the history of the Armenian Legislature.

Considering pupils of the upper middle schools and high school students as the main targets, the participants suggest linking each of these topics to the appropriate target group and, in particular, adapting them to the stages of the social science curriculum of public schools by offering specific topics and resources to the pupils in the relevant stage of the school curriculum and/or to the teachers working with those pupils.

Creating resources with similar content for teachers is especially emphasized, as there is a great lack of resources.

Excerpts from interviews: The RA NA Parliamentary Education Unit's educational content

- Emphasize the transition from law to statute, how law is defined by legislation and what is the role of the National Assembly there? To equip with skills on participating in public hearings, sending proposals, keeping in touch with the deputy. For example, the citizen should know that he can apply to the National Assembly regarding a gap in the law and not for any of his problems. He should know the functions of the members of the Parliament, what laws are being discussed in the National Assembly now, how many stages their discussion goes through. Also, the most basic things - how the National Assembly is formed, what parliamentarianism is, at a higher level - making of laws, the link between the National Assembly and the government, the National Assembly, and the community.

Social Science/Civic Education Expert

- Democracy, human rights, the role of parliament therein, representative democracy, also how direct democracy works, the way to relate with it. There can be a blog about the parliament in Armenia. High school can go deeper, 4th graders need simpler things. It should also be aligned with the school program. History of the Armenian parliament, the function of the parliament in a parliamentary country, and in Armenia. I think certain things will change with the upcoming constitution expected in 2021, but I do not think you can wait that long. It can also be general. Basically, what the National Assembly does, what it does not do and how can one, as a citizen, relate to the National Assembly, what kind of issues can be raised, by what tools, examples, how can one bring an initiative to the National Assembly by collecting signatures.

RA NA MP

- By the end of general education, we should already have a voter. They finish school at the age of 18. It is important to prepare students for political election. As a resource center, the NA center can do that work, prepare the voters, what to pay attention to during the elections, how to analyze the party platforms, what questions to ask about the financing and pre-election funds. Those questions that will help graduates make informed choices. Both methodologically and substantively, it [the center] should be able to develop guidelines, materials, train teachers in that area, implement projects, implement programs with schools, perhaps conduct pilot voting in schools, test on student council voting when we work on this model within the school. Alternatively, currently we are changing the procedure of electing the principal, where we make meetings with

students mandatory for the candidates, so that they can meet and answer the students' questions before developing the school development program, which is a binding document. The same phenomenon of election can be considered in the process of electing a school principal. It can also be used to democratize such a closed, traditional structure.

Staff member of the RA Ministry of ESCS

- The practical side is very weak in the system of education. Going to the National Assembly can be viewed as volunteering, gaining experience by the pupils and students. They will enter the government system, will see how a problem should be solved, what writing a law is, what research should be carried out for it. It will bring the children to the practical field and will help them a lot.

Social Science/Civic Education Expert

- Regarding the committees, there should be 2 layers: 1. By all means, all the visitors should know that there are committees in the National Assembly and in fact most of the work is done there; also which [committee] deals with what issue and that the National Assembly covers the entire public sector; 2. In case of more detailed familiarization with every committee, their interests should also be taken into account with regard to their projects. But as for the budget, for example, it should be said not only that there is such a committee, but rather in general - what is the budget, the connection of the budget with politics, the role of the National Assembly in the budget formation and maybe in 2-3 paragraphs how a citizen can become familiar with the budget, also at the community level, and, for instance, you can participate in its formulation through this or that channel.

RA NA MP

Stakeholders in the field of education, from policy-makers and authors of educational materials to teachers, students and pupils, believe that the practical component of education in the Armenian educational system is very weak and think that the RA NA educational programs should provide practical content and experience related to the legislature.

Most of the participants believed that within its thematic framework the PEU should try to develop knowledge, skills, and attitudes among the learners/participants. However, one of the civic education experts considered that such unit of the RA NA, due to its nature and location, should work only in the direction of knowledge and skills and should not develop attitudes, as it violates the principle of political impartiality and allows the ruling political power to create a biased position among the citizens.

Most experts and teachers, as well as some staff members of the RA Ministry of ESCS system, insist that teachers in Armenia are in need of interesting and effective educational resources. They also believe that the PEU may not be limited to macro-level products but may also suggest content-related offers. They expressed an opinion that since the National Institute of Education (NIE) was dissolved and the new structure responsible for the content is underway; education content development will be more competitive in the near future, the NA PEU may also pioneer content development for civic education.

4.4. Parliamentary Education Unit structure and functions, engagement of members of the Parliament, relations with other civic education institutions, and sustainability

In the opinion of a number of MPs, the PEU should be located in the premises of the RA NA and be subordinated to the RA NA Chief of Staff. The MPs who share this opinion, in particular, think that the PEU should be an internal structure, taking into account that it has work to do at various levels, and if it is not part of the RA NA hierarchy, it may face challenges, the processes may slow down, etc. They think that structurally the unit can be a department or a group of people in the NA Staff with implementation of educational programs as its main function. They also think that the PEU should liaise with the outreach center, the library and the visitor center and should be part of the RA NA External Relations in general. All this can be combined into one general department. The department will have a head, as well as persons in charge of

specific directions. The members of the Parliament note that at present citizens come to the RA NA with specific problems, and this will be a unit created to present and familiarize citizens with the RA NA, which will be incorporated into Public Relations.

In contrast to this approach, some MPs believe that in terms of institutional and legal status, the center should not function within the administration of the RA NA, as the Administration is a bureaucratic apparatus. MPs with such opinion do not think that the PEU employees should be civil servants, but would rather see the unit as research and educational think tank, which operates independently of the parties, and the current political arrangement of the RA NA may be reflected in its advisory board. Some think that the unit can technically be part of the RA NA, but have a board of directors, like foundations. The Board should be unbiased, neutral and it may include representatives from all the RA NA parties/factions, as well as scholars, people from the field of education, and other relevant experts who will oversee its work.

The members of the Parliament especially emphasized independence of the PEU from elections and their turnouts, and some even expressed the opinion that it is necessary to reflect/stipulate this, as well as the principle of political impartiality, work ethics and qualifications required in the job descriptions for the staff.

The MPs believe that the staff of the PEU should be fully responsible for the development of educational programs, materials, and resources, as well as for the implementation of educational programs, but they also consider cooperation with civil society possible. Some think that those responsible for the educational process should not be from the RA NA, but from outside, considering that the PEU should have a list/database of educators and, as needed, it can recruit necessary trainers and experts to fill a specific gap.

The MPs imagine their participation in the operation and programs of the PEU differently. Some think that they can visit schools during the stages of project-based teaching implemented at schools that are related to the RA NA and meet with students on sites, in the communities, explaining their work and functions. In addition to the trainers, the MPs of the committees can speak on certain topics, such as the functions of the committees, etc. In their opinion, practical meetings with MPs can also have an impact on the development of research skills, for instance, when discussing draft laws, organizing information campaigns, etc. MPs believe that their success stories can be useful and educative for students, especially if women talk about their difficulties and challenges. Depending on the topic, they can also tell about their visits abroad, covering the question of what parliamentary diplomacy gives to the National Assembly, the state, and the citizens of the Republic of Armenia. The MPs state that it is necessary to ensure that both the opposition and the ruling party are represented in meetings, to keep the balance.

Representatives of the RA Ministry of ESCS believe that the PEU should cooperate and coordinate its programs, or at least inform thereon the persons in charge of education, in particular, the relevant deputy ministers and also the Department of General Education. According to the respondents, this will help put the new structure on the right foundations and coordinate [its activities] with other existing educational programs.

Referring to the possibility of making the unit's programs part of the project-based learning of social sciences component of general education, some representatives of the RA Ministry of ESCS and teachers noted that the more such a program is research-oriented the better. They also expressed concern that if it is imperatively incorporated in the school curriculum, it may become a problem for the unit in the future; in order to avoid such a risk, the wording may be such that the curricula developed by the unit are a desirable but not mandatory part of project-based teaching

and at least ensures meetings with deputies and pupils' visits to the RA NA. Contrary to these views, however, another staff member of the RA Ministry of ESCS expressed the opinion that the more institutional is incorporation of the PEU's program(s) in school curricula, the better, noting in particular that the simplest method is incorporating the work with the unit in subject curricula as a requirement of the curricula in the form of study tours, PEU-school linkages, visits, distance or offline lectures, so that participation in the program is not the good will of the unit or educational institution.

As an important conceptual component, it was suggested that the unit should have the opportunity of working directly with stakeholders, such as the opportunity to participate in legislative hearings, or direct project work with students, when students have the opportunity to develop a bill and come up with a legislative initiative as per their educational level.

All participants of the interviews noted that the unit should be accessible on the Internet - a website, interactive components, age-appropriate materials and learning materials for both schoolchildren and teachers, as well as online visit registration with the option to choose a program.

They also think that cooperation of the PEU with other structures and citizens should be horizontal. It can be a direct collaboration with the class and the teacher, for example, when a class wants to visit the Parliament with its teacher, it is not necessary to wait for the whole school, an individual arrangement can be made.

With respect to sustainability, most of the participants of the needs assessment, both from the RA NA, the RA Ministry of ESCS and the expert community, think that to ensure sustainability of the unit's activity, two important conditions should be ensured:

- 1. aligning the educational offers of the PEU with the relevant stages of the social science curriculum of public schools, so that the demand for those programs is always present;
- 2. providing the unit with such legal status that in addition to financing from the RA NA budget it can raise funds from other sources.

The participants of the assessment also noted that by developing and implementing teacher training programs, the PEU could participate in teacher training tenders and thus obtain additional [financial] means.

V. Parliamentary education in other countries

To consider the existing international experience in developing the concept of the RA NA Parliamentary Education Unit, different international models and programs offered by the educational centers/units operating in the parliaments of a number of European and North American countries were observed. It was done through the desk review by exploring the available online sources, as well as through direct contacting such institutions and conducting remote interviews with educational program officers of the parliaments of four countries.

The study covered online resources of the parliaments of the United States, Germany, Canada, the United Kingdom, Scotland, and Sweden. Interviews were conducted with educational program officers in the parliaments of Germany, Canada, the United Kingdom, and Sweden, as well as with the Director of the Civic Education Center in the state of Saxony-Anhalt, Germany.

The study of international experience was aimed at exploring the experience of the parliaments of those countries, their successes and lessons learnt in the following directions:

- Implemented educational programs, their content and thematic framework, target groups, ways and methods of implementation;
- Organizational structure and institutional setup, staffing and legal status of the unit implementing educational programs;
- Funding and sustainability of the unit implementing educational programs.

The information obtained on each of these topics is presented below.

5.1. Educational programs, their content and thematic framework, target groups, ways and methods of implementation

5.1.1. Implemented educational programs, their content and thematic framework

The educational programs of most parliaments covered by the study, focus on **the branches of government**, **the activities**, **structure**, **and functions of the country's legislature**, **as well as the legislative process**. Some parliaments also cover the history of the legislature and the parliament building.

Thus, the website of the Visitor Center of the U.S. Congress conveys that the goal of the Center is to provide a welcoming and educational environment for visitors to learn about the unique characteristics of the House, the Senate and the legislative process as well as the history and development of the architecture and art of the U.S. Capitol. Most of the Center's educational materials are developed to stimulate discussions of the privileges and responsibilities of citizenship in a representative democracy and celebrate the roles that the House and the Senate play in people's daily lives. The topics of the materials and educational programs are diverse - from the constitution, branches of government, the structure of the Congress, the principles of formation of power to the history of the Congress, etc.

The Visitor Center website has an "Education" section which is regularly updated and has three main subsections, designed for three target groups, respectively: (a) students, (b) teachers, and (c) families. Each of the subsections offers real and virtual educational programs on the above-mentioned topics, resources, temporary and permanent exhibitions designed for respective groups. The student section programs and materials are for elementary, middle, and high schools, respectively, depending on the age characteristics of the groups. Here there are some

age-specific learning aids, supporting activities and games for online and in real-time performance. Many materials are adapted to the school curriculum to complement it. There is also a video tour of the Capitol.

In general, the website of the Visitor Center itself is a unique educational resource, because almost all its sections and subsections, and the content of these subsections provide certain information about the Congress, its structure, functions, history, as well as the history and architecture of the Capitol.

The main educational program of the Bundestag of the Federal Republic of Germany is "Parliamentary Democracy" role play, through which the participants gain an understanding of the structure of the Legislature, peculiarities of the legislative process, the role of committees, etc. In the scope of this role play, two days a week, 6-7-hour simulation of parliamentary routine (legislative process, planning, negotiations, decision-making) is performed for groups of 25 to 45 schoolchildren. Students assume the role of MPs, receive fictitious exit data, biographies, party profiles and documents, and make decisions based on the rules of procedure of the Bundestag. As a result, young people become familiar with the procedures of parliamentary factions, committees and plenary sessions, the ways of expressing their will and the relationship between the ruling and opposition forces in the parliamentary system. The role play develops the skills to orient and act independently, to present one's own interests, to consider the views of others, and to accept the legitimacy of different viewpoints. Content-related issues, such as human rights, international law, or environmental issues, are mainly addressed in the context of/in relation to the draft law being discussed during the game. For example, for a group of students the organizers choose a bill related to the UN peacekeeping mission, which will decide on the deployment of German peacekeeping troops. Here the participants should consider historical responsibility, human rights, international law, etc. In other words, while the program is built to get acquainted with the legislative process and the steps of that process, through the draft law under discussion the participants also address content and, in the words of the project manager, "the content enters through the backdoor."

In addition to this role play conducted twice a week, the Bundestag organizes a similar role play once a year for a larger group of about 300 people. Such many participants gives a sense close to reality, as 300 make up about half of the members of the Bundestag. The program is called "Youth in Parliament". Participants in this program can be proposed by every second member of the Bundestag from their constituency. The role play/program lasts 4 days and is organized in the Conference Hall and Committee Rooms. The participants discuss 4 bills for 4 days and have a real sense of the parliament, especially since the program itself is implemented in real settings.

One of the programs held once a year on the Holocaust Remembrance Day is a children's program, which is organized for about 80 participants, lasts 5 days and **covers mainly issues of memory and historical responsibility**. A similar four-day program is also held once a year on European issues.

In addition to these programs, the Bundestag also has a so-called "students' seminar", during which the main directions of parliamentary work are outlined and there is an opportunity to meet with a member of parliament. This program generally lasts about an hour and includes a school group meeting and a Q&A session with an MP. There is less demand for this program, and it is more difficult to organize it, because it is not always possible to bring an MP to a meeting.

For younger children (9-12 years old), the Bundestag organizes guided tours 4 times a year and presents the Bundestag in an easy-to-understand manner.

The Canadian Parliamentary Education package offers a wide range of digital and online opportunities. In the "Education" section of the Parliament's website, you can find a variety of technical tools for use from kindergarten to school, including mobile apps, thematic lesson plans, videos, virtual tours, and more. Online and print resources for teachers, teacher training and school tours (by registration) are also offered.

For children of kindergarten age to 3rd graders games, historical images related to the parliament and symbols are offered. For 4th to 6th graders there are online materials, role plays, a glossary, a teacher's guide, and other materials that illustrate the legislative process. With two levels of difficulty (grades 4 to 6 and grades 9 to 11), parliamentary committee simulations are offered. There are interactive materials on setting the senator's agenda for the 6th to 10th graders, parliament in the news, and lots of interactive materials on parliamentary governance for the 7th to 12th graders. Thematic plans are designed mainly for grades 8 to 12 and include texts, videos, presentations, forms, and other useful links. They detail the main question of the lesson, the class time, the learning outcomes, the curriculum links, and the competences acquired.

The content of the educational programs of the Canadian Legislature is **exclusively about the parliament - from its structure**, the two chambers, the role, and functions of those chambers, to participation and the legislative process. According to the educational program officer, they also briefly present the judicial and executive branches of government, as the division of branches of government is hard for people to understand and it is also important to be presented, as citizens must understand the differences between these branches and the unique place and role of the legislature. Nevertheless, 95% of the content and topics are about the Legislature itself. Different approaches are applied to present the material - from conferences (when someone, such as an expert on constitution, talks to participants) to discussions. They consider panel discussions to be the most successful format of their educational programs. MPs from different parties and factions are invited to these discussions and participants can ask them questions on the spot. In case of such format, it is especially important to have all the parties represented in the legislature. The cornerstone of the program is the real, practical interaction with the representatives of the Legislature and the main outcome is that the participants understand the human factor and accessibility of the parliament.

The following can particularly be singled out from the educational programs of **the United Kingdom's Parliament**:

- Visit to a community/school,
- Organization of annual parliament week festival,
- Teacher training, and
- Publication of the education newsletter for educators.

According to the Executive Support Officer of the Participation Unit at the UK Parliament, mission of the UK Parliamentary Education Programs is to support a thriving parliamentary democracy in the formation, dissemination, and development of understanding of parliamentary democracy among different segments of the society. In this regard, the content of educational programs helps people (a) feel the importance of/need for parliament, (b) participate, regardless of their place of residence, (c) take steps, be part of the process, get involved in parliamentary democracy, and (d) have influence on the parliament with their participation.

The unit implementing educational programs offers two options of both visiting schools and communities for educational purposes and organizing visits to the Parliament. Any school or

community group can choose and order a visit to their community/school based on their needs. In addition, it has a wide range of online resources and educational programs for all age groups. The Center also provides training for teachers on various civic education topics. The Center's online resources are very well organized, categorized by topics and target groups. The Center also has its own education newsletter, to which one can subscribe and receive it electronically. It is intended primarily for teachers and educators.

The UK Parliament also organizes the "UK Parliament Week" annual festival, which encourages citizen participation and includes a variety of educational activities from organization of debates to applications and public campaigns, voting, visits by MPs, local government officials, and more.

There is a separate section "Visit & Learn" on the **Scottish Parliament** website. This section organizes real and virtual visits to the Parliament, provides useful information on the **structure**, **history**, **rules of procedure**, **and work of the Parliament**, presents the calendar of events. It also has a separate "Education" subsection. In the Education subsection, one can find educational resources about the Scottish Parliament for teachers and learners, sign up for an educational visit to the Parliament, as well as take online interactive quizzes and games. The Education Center of the Scottish Parliament as well has an education newsletter. Of particular interest from the available educational resources are the Case Studies, which can be used to learn how to make legislative changes.

The Swedish Parliament is to the maximum open for the citizens. Every citizen can enter the parliament and attend a debate and public hearings. This approach is an important and practical application of the principle of transparency and accountability, which creates a sense of trust, participation, and ownership among citizens.

The Swedish Parliament offers visitors not only free access to the Parliament, but also guided tours, which provide information on the history of the Parliament, its daily work, structure and other issues. It should also be noted that English-language tours are also offered for foreign visitors⁹. The center also issues a periodical newsletter for teachers.

The Parliament has a specially designed public hall where up to 500 visitors can simultaneously follow the parliamentary debates. All this is done under quite strict security control: video recording and photography are prohibited, and visitors' personal belongings and bags are handed over for safekeeping.

Special educational visits are provided for student groups of 7th-9th grades where they are encouraged to participate in **Democracy Workshops** similar to the role play in the German Bundestag described above. During these workshops schoolchildren can try their hand at being members of the Riksdag, discuss bills and other issues of community importance through simulation games and role plays, participate in the voting, etc. During this simulation, schoolchildren are offered topics related to different areas, information needed to form an understanding about those topics, which serve as a basis for substantive discussions, debate on problem settlement, law provisions and other issues. 11

20

⁹ Official website of the Swedish Parliament. Visit the Riksdaghttps://www.riksdagen.se/en/visit-the-riksdag/

 $^{^{10}\}underline{\text{https://www.riksdagen.se/globalassets/16.-larare/demokrativerkstaden-arskurs-7-9/lararhandledning-till-demokrativerkstaden-2020---webb.pdf}$

¹¹https://www.riksdagen.se/sv/larare/demokrativerkstaden-for-arskurs-7-9/

The goal of the "Democracy Workshop" was to acquaint the participants with the legislative activity. The role play lasts about two hours, a separate area is provided for the event, where students act as parliamentarians, participate in committee discussions, faction sittings and the plenary session of the parliament. Although the role-play copies the Swedish parliament, it is not an absolute copy; for example, the parties represented in the role-play are not real, although they have a certain resemblance to the parties active in Sweden.

The role-playing takes place outside the parliament building, in a specially designated area, which, however, is quite close to the parliament building and at the end of the role play the group walks with the guide to the parliament and visits the public hall, from where they can follow what is happening in the session hall. Preparatory materials are provided for participation in the program, which are used by teachers and students before the visit. The groups that have a technical difficulty to visit the Swedish parliament perform the role play in the classroom.

The **Democracy Workshop** is intended for students aged 13-16 (7th-9th graders) and is integrated into the general education curriculum for social sciences. Reservations can be made through the website of the parliament; there is also a special section for teachers on the website. Reservation by phone or e-mail is also possible, but these options are hardly used.

In addition to the Democracy Workshop program, there is a study tour for students aged 15-20. These tours also last about two hours and are accompanied by an educational counselor. The visitors tour around the parliament, get acquainted with the history, legislative activity, oversight functions, etc. During the last 30 minutes of the tour, the visitors meet with the MP, who best suits the group of visitors in terms of representativeness. The Swedish parliament offers 16 such visits a week. In cases when a current plenary session is taking place, visitors have the opportunity to follow it from the public hall.

Ongoing changes in the content of the study tour are made by adapting to the parliamentary work process - the issues under discussion, the bills under consideration, etc. Whereas, in case of the Democracy Workshop program, the changes are more complex and radical, and require more time, as making changes in the preparatory materials is also time consuming.

Like the annual role play of the German Bundestag, the Riksdag Educational Center of Sweden organizes a large "Youth Parliament" role play every two years, which engages 345 young people and completely copies the activities of the parliament.

It should also be noted that the visit is not considered separate from the educational process; teachers and schoolchildren are encouraged to continue discussions after the visit and analyze the information received as a result of the visit in the classroom. The Parliament even offers some tips and formulated questions for the post-visit class work.

For middle and high school students the Swedish Parliament offers two different levels, which differ in both complexity and choice of tasks. The first level focuses on the structure and functions of the Riksdag, presents the legislative process, while the second level focuses on the details of the law-making process of parties and committees. The Parliament offers a special manual to teachers aimed at providing methodological recommendations on the integration of the visit into the educational process.

In terms of content, although none of the programs have a separate thematic targeting, nevertheless, great attention is paid to the coverage of democracy, human rights, the role of the parliament in democratic processes.

The center also has separate training courses for teachers, as it views teachers as important propagators of information about parliament. To this end, the center also develops and distributes textbooks for teachers, as well as free educational materials for pupils and students. These materials are updated after each parliamentary election.

For everyone interested, the parliament offers free English and Swedish tours - 26 tours a week in spring and autumn, and 10 tours in summer. The parliament also offers a virtual tour, through which virtual visitors can watch educational films, get acquainted with the activity of the parliament, etc.

In all cases studied, the programs for school-age children are tailored to the school curriculum and the needs of the age group. Moreover, every year the program managers update/revise the program to include new legislative initiatives, and/or reflect changes that have taken place.

5.1.2. Target groups and engagement methods

In general, the educational programs of all the parliaments under consideration have two main target groups:

- Teachers and educators:
- Schoolchildren of different grades/age groups

Engagement of these main groups is done in a variety of ways, but in recent years, when the programs of the parliaments under consideration are already popular and well-known, the predominant method of engagement has been **online registration of groups for a specific program**. In some cases, such as in case of the role play in the German Bundestag, the demand is so high that those wishing to participate must register online one year in advance.

The **Teachers Institute on Canadian Parliamentary Democracy** is a leader in the Canadian Parliament's programs. This program has been implemented for about 20 years and has been so successful that the parliaments of many countries have copied it and/or adopted a similar program. Each year, over 85 teachers from different Canadian provinces participate in the program.

According to the Parliament's educational program officer, the idea of targeting teachers was due to the fact that in Canada teachers do not receive much training in civic education, even those who teach history, political science, social sciences and other similar subjects in this area, had few training opportunities. Although the Teachers Institute is positioned as a vital opportunity for teachers' enhancement and improvement of classroom activity, and the program has a very good reputation and great popularity, teachers still face some difficulties in being absent from school for five days a year since the teacher's absence and finding a replacement is costly for the school. The program covers travel expenses, accommodation (hotel) and food expenses in Ottawa. And despite the great success of the program, it is not considered part of mandatory teacher training.

Unlike Canada, in Germany it is not the unit in charge of educational programs that is responsible for teacher training, but another subdivision of the Bundestag's Public Relations department. This subdivision organizes 1-2 seminars a year in cooperation with the Institute of Education (Teacher Training Institute). Both units are under the same Public Relations department, but do not work together. In general, according to our respondent, the Bundestag is built in such a way that different departments work with/for the same target group, and in case of starting this work from scratch, it is worth combining all this in the same department from the very beginning.

In case of schoolchildren, the recruitment is done by the teachers, who organize visits for pupils at the relevant stage. As we have already mentioned, in all countries, the programs designed for schoolchildren are necessarily adapted to the needs of the age group and the corresponding stage of the school curriculum. However, in case of almost all parliaments, most visiting schools are from the capital city or nearby communities. For that reason, educational program officers are exploring new ways to encourage visits from remote communities. In some cases, for example (UK), travel expenses are subsidized.

In addition to these key target groups, educational program officers are constantly looking for new groups. Particularly important is the engagement of less involved, passive (in civic terms), relatively disadvantaged groups. For example, the UK Parliament has outsourced a special survey to find out which groups are less involved in participatory processes, are politically passive and how to reach those groups. In the UK these groups include people with disabilities, people of African descent, ethnic minorities, and young women. Based on the results of the survey, parliamentary education programs began to specifically target these groups.

The German parliament also attaches importance to the inclusion of less privileged groups, as well as those differing from the main target groups. In case of Germany, such groups are, for example, NGOs and associations/unions, or students from vocational educational institutions, police officers, firefighters, nurses. Educational program developers follow the surveys, trying to understand which are the groups that do not have sufficient understanding of the political system and parliamentary democracy and how the system works, and develop programs for these groups or specifically involve them in existing programs.

5.2. Organizational and institutional structure, staff and legal status, funding sources and sustainability

In all the parliaments under consideration, the **educational centers and/or units implementing educational programs constitute part of the Parliament.** Often, educational unit is part of the Visitor Center, Public Relations department, or any other structure that performs such functions.

In Canada, for example, the unit responsible for educational programs is part of the Parliament Library. Here the library is independent of both chambers of the Parliament and the head of the library is directly/equally accountable to the Speakers of both chambers and thus the library, as well as the programs within the latter, are considered unbiased and independent of both chambers of parliament. The team in charge of the educational component in the German Bundestag is part of the Visitors' Service, and the main function of the Visitors' Service is to organize the visit of citizens and tourists to the Bundestag, including guided tours inside the building, organization of exhibitions on the history of the parliament, etc. In the United Kingdom, the Educational Center functions as part of the Participation Team, which in addition to educational functions includes other activities aimed at increasing citizen involvement. The Swedish Educational Center is part of the Parliament's Department for Visits, Education and Events.

In all four parliaments that participated in the interviews, the main staff involved in the educational programs/centers are civil or public servants. In almost all cases, the staff implementing educational programs consists of main and contractual staff. The main staff is responsible for the development of educational programs and the management and administration of those programs, while the contractual staff are typically involved in the implementation of the program itself.

The comparative review shows that the below-described two models of Canadian and German parliaments respectively can be further considered as possible options for the purposes of RA NA PEU.

Educational Center of the Canadian Parliament has 33-34 permanent staff and about 60 contractual staff. The main employees, who are also public servants, are responsible for the content and structure of the curriculum. Years of experience have proven that it is better to develop the content themselves, because the Parliament has its own peculiarities, its own language, and so on, and the materials are more accurately prepared when the developers are from the parliament itself. However, certain things, such as material design, etc., are outsourced to other professionals. In the Canadian model, the choice of tour guides and other front-line workers is interesting. These staff is mostly university students. They work full-time during the summer and winter holidays, and part-time during classes. The approach is to keep the front-line - those in direct contact with people - fresh through recruitment of young people. As our interlocutor notes, "On the one hand, recruitment of more experienced staff may facilitate the work of the center in terms of knowledge. but on the other, often the staff working here becomes stagnant because the work of the front-line is hard and people get tired of doing it for 10-15 years. The approach we have adopted is very difficult because we are constantly hiring and training new people, and they are also very young, often no more than 20 years old, but over the years we have seen that such an approach works best". It is noteworthy that the selection of these employees is not based on education and profession, but on skills and abilities. In other words, students do not have to be from the field of social sciences or humanities, but more importantly, they should be able to tell in an appealing way and engage participants. And finally, each of the tour guides develops his or her own program/text. There is a general guiding text, but everyone should be creative and develop their own programs.

In case of Germany it's exactly the opposite. Contractual staff here must have relevant education and experience, as they are paid quite well. When hired, they are not only interviewed, but also take a special knowledge test. Often these employees are of middle ages and older. There are three permanent employees: the project manager, who is generally responsible for the program content and implementation, and two others, who are mainly responsible for organizational tasks, from registering participants, checking their passports and security to providing with necessary rooms and arranging contractual staff's payments. Contractual staff is responsible for the performance of role-plays. One simulation usually involves two employees. They have a database of pre-selected contractual workers, which includes about 30 names. The Bundestag does not train these employees, it is expected that, first, they have the appropriate professional training and, secondly, they are engaged in self-education and professional enhancement.

It should be noted that the issue of the spaces allocated for the implementation of educational programs is settled in different ways, but according to the interviewees, the parliaments, after using the parliament's premises for educational purposes for many years, finally felt the need for having their own educational center. The UK has already set up its own center, which has a model hall like the real parliamentary session hall, as well as many other rooms equipped with modern digital media. Canada and Germany are currently building their respective centers.

According to our interviews, parliamentary education centers/units and programs are funded almost exclusively from Parliaments' budgets. According to some interviewees, leveraging funding from other sources, particularly the private sector, is not always considered appropriate, as usually it comes with some thematic priorities and the country's legislature must in any case maintain its independence and the neutrality of educational programs. Some funds are raised through partnership with other government agencies, as well as through tickets sold to visitors and

schools that in some countries cover the travel-related expenses of program participants. According to the representatives of parliamentary education units, funds allocated to educational programs usually make up 1-2% of the total budget of the Parliament. For example, in case of Canada, the budget for educational programs is around 4 million Canadian Dollars, constituting 10% of the budget of the Library of Parliament (the Library's budget is 40 millions), which according to Senior Director of the Public Education Programs is a very small fraction of overall Parliament's budget, less than 1%. In Germany, the annual budget is EUR 750,000-1 million, which is usually around 1-2% of the total Bundestag budget. In Sweden, the entire budget of the Rikstag Administration is around EUR 88 million, and the budget for Department for Visits, Education and Events is nearly EUR 2 million, which is over 2% of the total Administration budget. However, this includes only the salaries of the permanent and contractual staff, as according to the Coordinator of Educational Activities "You can only include salaries for education communications officer and our hourly-employed guides. Depreciation can also be included for investments (for example for the role-playing game Democracy Workshop), internal costs such as cleaning, security services and other real estate costs. It is simply very difficult to give an exact amount."

Sustainability of the programs is mainly ensured through their continuous update and alignment with the school curriculum, so as it would still be demanded by the main target groups, the teachers and students. Also, these target groups, as well as their civic education needs are constantly changing and there is a continuous demand for the offered programs for new groups, as well as a need to address their changing needs.

VI. Concept for the RA NA Parliamentary Education Unit

6.1. Mission, goal, and objectives of the Parliamentary Education Unit of the RA NA

The **mission, goal and objectives** of the Parliamentary Education Unit of the RA NA were formulated based on the analysis of the experience of other countries, and as a result of comparison of the understanding and viewpoints of RA education policy makers, Members and staff of the RA NA, representatives of educational NGOs, education experts/researchers, and teachers/students/pupils participating in focus groups, as well as the review of legal and structural framework.

The **mission** of the PEU of the RA NA is to educate, inform, engage, and inspire the citizens of the Republic of Armenia on the key values and principles of participatory and pluralistic democracy.

The **goal** of the PEU is to create a more active, competent, effective, critical-thinking and responsible citizen through non-formal education, trainings, visits, internships, other educational programs, as well as development of online learning packages, various supporting materials, teaching aids and civic education resources.

To achieve this goal, the PEU sets the following **objectives**:

- (a) Develop and implement short-term and long-term educational programs for different target groups, the participants of which will gain **basic knowledge** of participatory democracy and the role of the National Assembly in such a system, and will become familiar with the theory and history of participatory democracy.
- (b) Develop and implement short-term and long-term educational programs for different target groups, the participants of which will acquire **practical skills** necessary for being an active, competent citizen in a democratic system.
- (c) Develop and implement short-term and long-term educational programs for different target groups on the history and tradition of democracy and parliamentarianism in Armenia, the participants of which **will gain an understanding** of the peculiarities of establishment and functioning of the democratic system in Armenia.
- (d) Become a **resource center** for formal and non-formal educators, teachers, and trainers at various levels by developing teaching aids, supporting materials, information booklets on key topics of the Unit, etc.

6.2. Parliamentary Education Unit target groups and potential educational programs

Most interview participants think that in a broader sense and for a longer term, the PEU should and can develop and implement educational programs for any group interested in participatory democracy, in particular parliamentarianism and the Armenian experience of parliamentarianism. Nevertheless, both the participants of local needs assessment and the international experience indicate that schoolchildren and students, particularly the ones in upper middle school and high school, as well as university students, should be regarded as primary target groups. The international experience studied shows that teachers are also an important target, especially in North American countries and the United Kingdom. The importance of creating necessary resources for teachers was also raised by a few education experts who participated in the interviews, including authors of the state education standards, as well as some representatives of

the RA Ministry of ESCS. The latter, however, emphasized that the PEU can implement teacher training programs on a competitive basis by participating in open tenders for such trainings.¹²

Based on the above, it is recommended to focus on teachers and development of teaching resources at the initial phase of PEU's activity and then step-by-step start the development and implementation of training programs for other target groups. Overall, based on the study of the international experience and the interviews, the following target groups are identified:

- Upper middle school and high school students, (ages 14 to 18)
- Lower middle schoolchildren (ages11-13)
- Social Science and History teachers of public schools
- University students
- Lecturers of relevant departments of universities (law, political science, economics, etc.)
- Local self-government representatives
- Civic initiatives and non-governmental organizations
- Interested adults
- Any other group upon request/need

As during the interviews representatives of the executive bodies and educational organizations singled out the students of upper grades of public schools as the main target group for the PEU and this same view was reaffirmed by the pupils, students and teachers who participated in the focus groups, most of the educational packages of the Unit should be intended for the 9th or 10th graders of public schools, and the rest for students, teachers, and other target groups. The remaining 30% is intended for students, teachers, and other target groups.

Table 2 below presents the potential offers of the unit by target groups. The preliminary version of the table was compiled based on a comparison of opinions expressed during the interviews with the MPs, education policy makers, experts, and NGO representatives implementing civic education programs. The educational offers and content are designed so that they can be selectively adapted to the specific needs of different groups, supplemented with new topics and so that they ensure some flexibility.

¹² In Armenia for a long time the main body responsible for the content of education and teachers training was the National Institute of Education (NIE), which, however, was dissolved in 2019. The reforms envisage creation of a new structure, which will delegate teachers training to various organizations on a competitive basis.

Table 2. Potential proposals of the RA NA Parliamentary Education Unit by target groups			
Target group	Type of proposal	Format/methods	
9th graders of the RA public schools	Providing empirical knowledge tailored to the schedules of the subjects of Social Science and History	Real or virtual visit to the RA NA , presentation, game-excursion, role play, online game/quiz, animated video, meeting with MP (at school or in the RA NA)	
10th-11th graders of the RA public schools	Implementation of Research and Development programs adapted to the schedule of Social Science discipline	Online work with the RA NA PEC, support for the project implementation, provision of educational resources, meetings/discussions with the MPs, one day with the deputy, participation in the work of the committees, organization of Democracy Workshop	
Teachers of Social Science and History of public schools	Development and publication of resources, content, teaching aids necessary for the curricula of Social Science and History; publication of information bulletins at regular intervals in a language understandable and accessible to teachers, where the amendments to the laws that address Social Science discipline will be presented; Creating/providing thematic role-plays, quizzes, and simulations to teachers, including a descriptive section on game organization that will help the teachers apply it in their practice; Organization of trainings for teachers, development of	Online access to materials/resources, availability of bulletin subscription system, organization of summer and winter schools, trainings, seminars, workshops, lectures - both online and offline.	

DRAFT

	preparation of materials for Case studies	
University students	Assistance in research work, acquisition of practical skills, formation of knowledge, attitude/position	Organization of internship, volunteering, mentoring, participation in the work of the RA NA committees, short-term thematic courses, seminars, workshops, access to/availability of the RA NA library/e-library resources, accessibility of online resources, organization of online lectures - outreach and in the RA NA PEU
Lecturers of relevant departments of universities (law, political science, economics, etc.)	Development and publication of resources, content, manuals and teaching aids, publication of information bulletins at regular intervals, organization of thematic trainings, seminars, conferences	Online access to materials/resources, availability of bulletin subscription system, organization of short-term training sessions, seminars, workshops and conferences, availability of/access to the RA NA library/e-library resources
Local self-government representatives	Providing knowledge of the key principles of participatory democracy, localized also for local self-government bodies	Online access to materials/resources, organization of trainings for the representatives of newly elected Councils of Elders and local self-government bodies in the communities
Interested adults	Development of non-formal educational packages according to needs	Combination of approaches/methods deriving from the package
Any other group upon request/need	Development of educational packages according to needs	Combination of approaches/methods deriving from the package

6.3. Content/thematic framework of the PEU's's programs

The Concept proposes to focus the content of the programs of the RA NA Parliamentary Education Unit on the development of **civic competence**. In 2006 the Council of Europe and the European Parliament identified eight key Lifelong Learning Competences, including "social and civic competences", towards the development of which various civic education programs should aim at. In 2018 the Council of Europe released a slightly revised version of those eight competences. According to this definition, **civic competence is the ability to act as a responsible citizen, to participate fully in civic and social life, based on knowledge of social, economic, legal and political concepts and structures, as well global developments and sustainability.**

The Reference Framework of Competences for Democratic Culture adopted by the Council of Europe in April 2018 is also of great practical importance for the activities of the RA NA Parliamentary Education Unit. It sets a total of 20 competences in four areas: Values, Attitudes, Skills, Knowledge and Critical understanding.¹⁵

The state standard for general education, submitted for public discussion and then approval by the RA Ministry of ESCS in 2019, defines, among other things, **democratic and civic competence** as one of the eight key competences expected of a public school graduate in Armenia. ¹⁶ According to the standard, this competence is defined as follows:

Democratic and Civic Competence - Learners contribute to the development of a society that is based on democracy, freedom, social justice, and the rule of law. Through cognition, they cultivate love for the homeland, realize the national, state, public interests and priorities arising from the RA Constitution at the regional and global levels. Learners value human life and dignity attach importance to their civic duty and the culture of civic participation as the foundation for the viability of democracy. They recognize the cultural, state, and legal, economic spheres of public life and analyze them in a comprehensive manner, demonstrate proactivity, ability to make decisions independently and implement them, and willingness to take responsibility for the consequences.

To cultivate this ability, development of appropriate knowledge, skills and attitude is required. In fact, the NA Parliamentary Education Unit can create such content and educational programs in certain directions of civic education which will contribute to the development of both knowledge and skills and formation of attitude/disposition.

Our research identified the following key subject areas for the RA NA PEU:

Subject area 1. Democracy

- Roots and Armenian Enlightenment
- Participatory and pluralist democracy
- Active citizenship
- History of Armenian parliamentarianism

¹³ https://eur-lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=OJ:L:2006:394:0010:0018:EN:PDF

¹⁴ https://op.europa.eu/en/publication-detail/-/publication/297a33c8-a1f3-11e9-9d01-01aa75ed71a1/language-en

¹⁵https://www.coe.int/en/web/campaign-free-to-speak-safe-to-learn/reference-framework-of-competences-for-democratic-culture

¹⁶ https://www.e-draft.am/projects/2560/about

Subject area 2. Law and Constitution

• Law and statute: Human rights

Constitution

• Elections: formation of the parliament

• Separation of powers

Subject area 3. Parliamentarianism

Political ideas and parties

• Legislative, supervisory and representative functions of the National Assembly

• Legislative process

NA structure and routine

The selection of the topics is primarily based on the opinions expressed during the interviews and focus groups. In particular, most of the interviewed experts believe that it is difficult for the learners to understand the transition to a parliamentary system of governance after the constitutional amendments in the Republic of Armenia, and materials/resources on the parliamentary system and parliamentarianism need to be developed. During the focus group discussion, the students also expressed the opinion that they are leaving school without any good understanding of the parliamentary system, as well as the division of power and the principle of checks and balances. They also believe that in order to be an active citizen, they need civic selforganization skills, as well as a better understanding of elections, parties, and ideologies. In the MP's opinion, the citizens generally do not have an idea of the functions of the National Assembly. how it works, its structure, and for that reason they often expect things from the Parliament that in general are beyond its competence and functions. The MPs also attach importance to the knowledge related to the legislative process. In this regard pupils, teachers and students agree with the Members of Parliament. They, too, believe that it is necessary to enhance the knowledge about the legislative process and provide opportunities to acquire practical skills. Especially the schoolchildren and students, but also the MPs think that the knowledge and understanding of Human Rights are very limited and it is necessary to deepen it to be a more protected citizen. The inclusion of topics related to the history and theory of democracy, the Armenian Enlightenment and the history of Armenian parliamentarianism is especially emphasized by the education experts, as well as some students. The analysis of the international experience also suggests that these are the topics of primary importance: almost all the programs/centers we have studied have topics covering the history and roots of democracy.

Thus, the thematic framework of the programs proposed by the concept (Table 3) is designed to form through its components the partial competences listed in Table 4, which correspond to the key and partial competences of the Reference Framework of Competences for Democratic Culture (2018) and are in line with the competences included in the Standard of the RA general education. The educational programs of the PEU should be designed in such a way that certain knowledge, skills, values and attitude on selected topics are developed among the relevant target groups. To this end the PEU can implement both long-term and short-term educational programs, as well as create content and resources. Moreover, both the international experience and our interviews show how the PEU's programs can both fill the gaps in formal education and contribute to it by integrating, for example, into the group of social science-related subjects, developing resources for teachers of Social Science and learners, and be stand-alone non-formal educational programs.

Longer-term programs may have components of theory, history and practice, and relatively short programs, with the duration of 1-2 hours to a day, may focus on one thing only. It is necessary that each educational module of the NA PEU is based on its content framework, from the components of which different packages can be created.

DRAFT

The content framework of the NA PEU is aimed at developing **theoretical**, **practical**, **and historical** knowledge about participatory and pluralistic democracy, parliamentarianism, legal and legislative processes, and competences for working with that knowledge.

Table 3. Subject areas and components of the content framework of the RA NA Parliamentary Education Unit				
Subject areas/ Sections	1. Democracy Roots and Armenian Enlightenment, participatory and pluralist democracy, active citizenship, history of Armenian parliamentarism	2. Law and Constitution Law and statute, human rights, constitution, elections: formation of the parliament, three branches of government	3. Parliamentarianism Political ideas and parties, legislative, supervisory, and representative functions of the National Assembly, legislative process, NA structure and routine	
Theory	What is Enlightenment? - redefining education (Kant) philosophical questions	Origin of law Law and statute from the philosophical point of view The principle of the rule of law - Universal Declaration of Human Rights - reflection of rights in laws	Political ideas and parties - freedom, equality, and justice - political ideas and ideologies - political parties	
	Development of democratic governance systems Comparative analysis of totalitarian, monarchical and democratic systems	Constitution Constitutional norms Constitutional bodies	What are the Parliament's functions? - legislative work - supervisory function - representative function	

	 What is participatory democracy? participatory culture participatory democracy What is pluralist culture? the individual and the social usefulness of pluralism 	 3 branches of government and their separation Legislature, Executive, Judiciary checks and balances Comparative analysis of governance systems The role of parliament in parliamentary system 	 Laws as a result of socio-economic relations How laws regulate state-market relations (international examples) What kind of tax systems exist?
Practice	 Forms of participation petitions, rallies trade unions, associations, civic initiatives, non-governmental organizations 	Formation of the Parliament NA elections How was the National Assembly formed? The problems of representative democracy	How the parliament performs its functions? - legislative work - supervisory function - representative function
	Pluralist culture - conducting meetings - compromise decisions - democratic skills	The work of Constitutional bodies Separation of the three branches of government and their checks and balances in reality	 National Assembly routine role of deputies, meeting, and work with the deputy role of the committees, participation in the committee sittings Analysis of the activities of the factions and deputies

	Civil society - civic initiatives - non-governmental organizations - trade unions	Connection of party ideologies with real decisions - analysis of party ideologies and real politics	Inter-party work - ideological debate and presentation of interests role-playing with the participation of interest-based and ideological unions, decision-making and voting
History	 Armenian Enlightenment The process and stages of the Armenian Enlightenment movement Main figures and ideas The revolutionary period of the 20th century The great rift of the 20th century: Genocide and Stalin's repressions 	The historical process of gaining rights - Movements that have resulted in the enactment of various human rights First Constitutions (Document of Shahamir Shahamiryan)	Political currents of 18th to 19th centuries in Armenia - Political ideologies - The first Armenian parties
	Popular movement of 1988 - Environmental initiatives - Artsakh movement 1991 Proclamation of the Republic of Armenia as a democratic, legal and social state	 Law and statute in the Armenian history Examples from history Working with documents and analysis in a historical context Legal regulations of the First Republic Method of formation 	 The Parliament of the First Republic Data on the composition of the parliament of 1918 Political processes in the First Republic Political struggle and reorganization during the fall of the First Republic and the formation of Soviet Armenia The goals and relations of the Armenian political forces

		 Working with documents and analysis in a historical context Legal regulations of Soviet Armenia Method of formation Working with documents and analysis 	
independen Velvet revo - The rise	ment of newly at Armenia and 2018 clution e of the civic movement et revolution	 in a historical context RA legislation and international legislation Consistencies and contradictions Examples from the history of newly independent Armenia 	Change in the role of the parliament as a result of the constitutional changes in newly independent Armenia - Constitutional changes

The development of "democratic and civic competence" relies on the formation of several partial competences or sub-competences.¹⁷ The following partial competences related to social science will be developed through the components included in the above thematic framework.

Table 4: Partial competences

Activity	Partial competences		
Educational process	 Professional competence 		
	Analytical thinking competence		
	Judgment competence		
	Social science - methodological competence		
	Communication competence		
	Value competence		
	Competence of responsible acting		
Research & Development	Participatory competence		
	 Competence for independent orientation and acting 		
	Decision-making competence		
Role plays	Debating competence		
	Negotiating competence		
	 Competence for presenting one's own interests 		
	Competence for accepting the legitimacy of other views		

The educational programs and resources developed by the RA NA PEU should generally be guided by this thematic framework and pillars, but can be implemented in different formats, using different methods and for various durations, depending on the specifics of the target group and topic. Apart from the history of parliamentarianism and democracy, separate materials and programs can be developed on the history and architecture of the building and other peculiarities of the RA NA. The area of the National Assembly itself can be an educational resource for the Unit's programs.

6.4. Where to start from? Scenario/option selection

When speaking about the lessons learned, a Head of the Educational Programs of one of the Parliaments we have interviewed, advised to start the work of the new unit in small steps. The main advice was to not choose between the visitor center and the educational programs, but rather start both the visitor center and educational programs, but with small steps. Given the financial and human resources required for setting up a fully functioning program with different components, and based on the needs assessment and international experience studied, it is proposed to take this advice seriously and select **two out of the three possible programs**

¹⁷ Description of competences is provided in the Volume 2 of the Reference Framework of Competences for Democratic Culture of the Council of Europe, available at: https://www.coe.int/en/web/campaign-free-to-speak-safe-to-learn/reference-framework-of-competences-for-democratic-culture. For additional information on partial competences, see the State Standard for Social Science of Rheinland Pfaltz region of Germany: https://www.edoweb-rlp.de/resource/edoweb:7009348/data

suggested below as a starting point for the PEU. The PEU can then gradually build on/expand its programs.

Table 5: Suggested Programs/Options			
Scenario/Option 1.	Democracy Workshop/role play		
Partial competences	 Analytical thinking competence Judgment competence Communication competence Value competence Participatory competence Competence for independent orientation and acting Decision-making competence Debating competence Negotiating competence Competence for presenting one's own interests Competence for accepting the legitimacy of other views 		
Target	High school and university students		
Duration	1 day		
Number of participants	20-30		
Facilitators	2		
Subject area/component presented in Table 3	Parliamentarianism/parliamentary routine/legislative process		
Background	Adapt the described Swedish Democracy Workshop or German simulation role play to the context of the National Assembly of Armenia. Accordingly, prepare role descriptions, select the bills to be discussed, build the process in accordance with the process of the National Assembly of Armenia		
Scenario/Option 2.	Teacher training		
Partial competences	 Professional competence Analytical thinking competence Judgment competence Social science - methodological competence Communication competence Value competence 		
Target	Teachers of history and social science		
Duration	4-5 days		
Number of participants	12-15		

Facilitators	2 main	
Subject area/component presented in Table 3	Any topic can be selected	
Background	Training course on selected topics related to	
	the National Assembly through lectures,	
	panel discussions, case studies, meetings	
	with NA members, practical assignments.	
Target	Pupils of middle school	
Duration	1-2 hours	
Number of participants	Up to 20	
Facilitators	1	
Subject area/component presented in Table 3	Parliamentarianism	
Background	Visit to the National Assembly and an	
	excursion in the National Assembly	
	/Armenian Parliamentarianism	

For the beginning, the RA NA can select and develop two of the proposed programs and pilot for a limited number of groups, further expanding firstly the number of participants, and then the programs.

6.5. Structure and functions of the Parliamentary Education Unit

Based on the mission, goal and objectives developed after the local needs assessment and the study of international experience, the PEU should have the following functions:

- Development and implementation of educational programs (trainings, courses, workshops, seminars, lectures, etc.)
- Implementation of research programs on the topics included in the thematic framework of the PEU
- Creation and dissemination of educational resources (educational materials, educational games, supporting materials, teaching aids, information manuals, etc.)
- Development of study tour packages for educational and information purposes and organization of visits to the National Assembly
- Organization of the NA's visits to schools and other educational institutions for educational and information purposes
- Organization of internships, volunteering, mentoring, educational-research activities in the National Assembly
- Offer of online materials and virtual education package, strong online presence.

To best perform these functions, the PEU should have a permanent staff of at least five (5) persons, consisting of the following specialists:

- 1. PEU director/manager
- 2. PEU educational programs officer
- 3. PEU research programs and educational resources officer
- 4. Program assistant
- 5. Administrative assistant
- 6. IT/SMM Specialist

Brief job descriptions of the staff members are attached as Annex 6.

Based on the experience of the parliaments of other countries under consideration, the Unit may, if necessary, involve other short-term experts and trainers to implement specific programs. The PEU should also work in close collaboration with the RA NA Library and Information Center.

Many participants of the needs assessment believe that in order for the PEU to have some flexibility and be able to participate in tenders for teacher training, development and implementation of educational programs for different groups, the PEU should be a functioning entity within the RA NA structure, but with a separate legal status. According to those who share this opinion, if the PEU does not have a separate legal status, the RA NA procedures can complicate its participation in tenders and grant competitions. In Armenia, State non-commercial organizations (SNCOs) or Foundations are the entities that enjoy such a status. In this case the founder will be the National Assembly and it will function within the NA system. If this option is selected, then the SNCO or the Foundation should have a board that would ensure impartiality through the involvement of representatives of all factions in the board.

However, this approach has opponents among the participants of the needs assessment. The studied international experience also suggests that it is more appropriate to have the PEU as a department/division within the Parliament structure, and not as a separately registered legal entity. In all the parliaments interviewed, the main staff of the education unit is part of the Parliament administration, i.e. they are civic or public servants. If this option is selected, the core staff will be civil servants responsible for the content and management of the programs, while the contractual staff can be involved in program implementation. This would (a) allow the unit to not heavily depend on external funding; and (b) make it easier to make necessary arrangements within the Parliament. If this second option is selected, then there will be no separately registered entity and the RA NA would have to directly participate in tenders.

To best organize the work of the PEU, it needs to have two offices in the premises of the National Assembly, at least one auditorium, and another hall/room for the organization of games and simulation exercises. The hall and the auditorium should be equipped with modern equipment and means of media required for educational programs.

6.6. Types of Activities

Based on the results of the needs assessment and particularly the study of the international experience, the following main activities can be carried out by the PEU:

- Implementation of educational programs in the space allocated to it in the National Assembly, as well as in the premises of the National Assembly, in general, for specific programs;
- Carrying out regional/community visits in the framework of some educational programs, organization outreach lectures;
- Organization of summer and winter schools for teachers and other target groups;
- Organization of online courses;
- Creation of online/digital and offline resources for different target groups;

Parliaments of all the countries studied have either separate websites for their educational centers and/or programs, or a separate section dedicated to education on the parliament website. By comparing the experience of different countries and the information received through the local needs assessment, it is suggested that the Parliamentary Education Unit of the National Assembly of the Republic of Armenia should also have its own website or section dedicated to it with the following tentative sections and main subsections.

About the NA	Visit to the NA	Outreach/Visit to a
 History Structure Building	 Register Select a package Ask a question 	community/school Schedule Packages Register
Online education	For schoolchildren High school Projects Training courses Register Middle school Video recordings Video films Visit	For teachers
Educational resources	Virtual NA	Create your visit

6.7. Ensuring Sustainability

For the continuity and sustainability of the PEU activities, it is necessary to ensure settlement of two important issues: continuous provision of content updates and financial sustainability. At the same time, both local needs assessment and the study of international experience suggest that a major factor for ensuring suitability is the alignment of the educational offers of the educational unit with the relevant stages of the social science curriculum of public schools, so that the demand for those programs is always present.

From the point of view of solving the first issue, i.e. content updates, the proposed structure and methodology for the PEU enable to identify and develop the content of necessary new programs and update existing ones through monitoring of current programs, analysis of visitor statistics, as well as cooperation with other RA NA subdivisions, the Government, civil society and international partners.

Following that logic, potential ways of improving the content could be development of programs that include additional target groups (primary school, researchers, press, the elderly people, civil servants, tourists, local government representatives, etc.), as well as development and implementation of targeted programs in the unit which may address specific areas or topics, such as women's or children's rights, or may present an individual process: committee work, law-making or review, NA-Government communication, etc.

In the proposed ways, the PEU will be enabled to regularly update the content of the services offered, as well as to monitor the dynamics of public interest, which itself is a process of providing important and applicable data.

Financial sustainability of the PEU has three key components:

- Allocation from the state budget (as part of the NA budget). This component forms the socalled core funding, which is the foundation of the Unit's ongoing activities and will mostly cover the salaries of the permanent and some contractual staff.
- Funds generated through fundraising. This component is funding through programs implemented because of collaboration with local and international donors, which allows to initiate and implement new substantive programs and update existing ones. For the effective implementation of this function, either the legal status of the PEU needs to be considered or the issue of establishing a foundation adjunct to the National Assembly should be discussed.
- Service fees paid by visitors. This component is formed from the entrance fee of visitors, sale of souvenirs, the amount paid for additional programs. It should be taken into account that visits for primary target groups (schoolchildren, students) should always be free and the funds allocated for these services should be covered either from the main budget of the PEU or reimbursed by other institutions (RA Ministry of ESCS, higher educational institutions). It should also be considered that this share of the budget is variable, and in case of effective work of the Unit it can grow creating additional financial resources.

VII Conclusions

(a) Program and Content

Based on the results of the needs assessment and the analysis of the international experience, the study has concluded that the Parliamentary Education Unit of the RA NA **should focus on a content relevant to Parliament's mandate.** The research has identified the following main subject areas that can be at the core of the Parliament's educational programs and curriculum:

Subject area 1. Democracy

- Roots of the Armenian Enlightenment
- Participatory and pluralistic democracy
- Active citizenship
- History of Armenian parliamentarianism

Subject area 2. Law and Constitution

- Law and statute: Human rights
- Constitution
- Elections: formation of the parliament
- Three branches of power

Subject area 3. Parliamentarianism

- Political ideas and parties
- Legislative, supervisory, and representative functions of the National Assembly
- Legislative process
- NA structure and routine

However, at the beginning it is recommended to develop one, maximum two programs and pilot those on small number of groups, and then based on the results to revise/adjust the programs and expand their coverage, reaching out to more groups. The initial programs could have up to two target groups and those can be high school students and social science teachers, depending on the program chosen by the National Assembly from the suggested options. The Program to start with could be Democracy Workshop/Simulation/Role Play for high school students.

The selected programs should be developed in accordance with the competency-based learning approach and synergized with the existing public education curriculum for social science.

(b) Institutional Structure and Setup

With respect to the legal status, some participants of the local needs assessment suggested having the PEU as a separate registered entity within the Parliament, i.e. something like an SNCO or a Foundation. The main idea behind is that in this case it can also do its own fundraising. However, the experience of other parliaments studied suggests that **the staff of the Unit should be part of the Parliament structure**. Usually, educational programs are within a unit responsible for external affairs and visitors, such as Visitor Center or Public Relations and Outreach. The core/main staff of parliamentary education programs/centers are usually civil servants. The core/main staff in the studied Parliamentary programs/centers is mostly responsible for the content development and organizational logistics, while the actual implementation of the programs (i.e.

trainers, guides etc.) is done by short-term staff/contractors who are competitively selected based on pre-defined criteria.

Based on this, as well as on the identified functions the Unit should perform, we propose for the Unit to have a core staff of at least five (5) persons, consisting of the following specialists:

- (a) PEU director/manager
- (b) PEU educational programs officer
- (c) PEU research programs and educational resources officer
- (d) Program assistant
- (e) Administrative assistant
- (f) IT/SMM Specialist

These staff should be Civil Servants in the Parliament. The rest can be contractors/hires for specific programs.

The PEU should have an office space and training rooms in the building of the Parliament, as well as equipment and other technical means for organization of educational programs.

(c) Types of Activities

Based on the results of the needs assessment and particularly the study of the international experience, the following main activities can be carried out by the PEU:

- Organization of online courses;
- Creation of online/digital resources for different target groups;
- Implementation of educational programs in the space allocated to the unit in the National Assembly, as well as in the premises of the National Assembly in general;
- Organization of regional/community visits in the framework of some educational programs, organization of outreach lectures;
- Organization of summer and winter schools for teachers and other target groups.

(d) Sustainability

Two important sustainability factors are considered: programmatic and financial. In terms of programmatic sustainability, the proposed structure and methodology allow identification and development, as well as ongoing update of the programs, through monitoring of current programs, analysis of visitor statistics, as well as cooperation with other NA subdivisions, the Government, public schools, and civil society. Thus, the PEU will be enabled to regularly update the content of the services offered, as well as to monitor the dynamics of public interest.

For the financial sustainability of the Unit three main sources should be considered: (a) allocation from the state budget (as part of the NA budget); (b) funds generated through fundraising for specific programs; and (c) service fees paid by visitors.

(e) Strategic Direction: Way Forward

As the international experience suggests, the best path to take would be to start small and then to develop into a large-scale program. Thus, the PEU could be established with two (2) full-time permanent staff members, i.e. PEU Director/Manager and the Educational Programs' Officer, who would be responsible for setting the unit administratively, and for the development and piloting of

DRAFT

one educational program, for example, Democracy Workshop for high school students, in the first year. In the second year, the PEU can involve a program/administrative assistant and an IT/SMM Specialist. The piloted program can now become fully functional and running and the main staff would work on reaching out to schools and involving appropriate target groups, as well as the establishment of its online presence. At the same time, the staff can work on the development of resources for social science teachers and identification of new target groups, and the development of new programs. Thus, year by year the PEU will evolve, running its core programs, implementing one-time, short-term activities, as well as developing new programs, and reaching out to new target groups.

VIII. Annexes

Annex 1. List of Respondents

	Name, last name	Organization
1	Sargis Khandanyan	RA NA MP, My Step
2	Mikayel Zolyan	RA NA MP, My Step
3	Anna Kostanyan	RA NA MP, Bright Armenia
4	Hamazasp Danielyan	RA NA MP, My Step
5	Hovhannes Hovhannisyan	RA NA MP, My Step
6	Zhanna Andreasyan	RA Ministry of ESCS, Deputy Minister
7	Artur Martirosyan	RA Ministry of ESCS, Deputy Minister
8	Samvel Karabekyan	RA Ministry of ESCS, Advisor to the Minister
9	Artashes Torosyan	RA Ministry of ESCS, Head of the General Education
		Department
10	Alexander Shagafyan	Head of the RA Education Inspectorate
11	Lilit Mkrtchyan	Lead/Expert of the MoESCS Working Group on State
		Standard for Social Science discipline group
12	Karine Harutyunyan	Member of the MoESC Working Group on State
		Standard for Social Science discipline group/Expert of
		Civic Education
13	Serob Khachatryan	Member of the MoESC Working Group on State
		Standard for Social Science discipline group/Expert of
1.4	A 1 , X7 1	Civic Education
14	Ashot Voskanyan	Civic Education/Social Science Expert, History
		Professor at the American University of Armenia,
1.5	Hash Davidson	former MP
15 16	Hrach Bayadyan	Civic Education/Social Science Expert
10	Goharik Tigranyan	Civic Education Expert, Member of the MoESC Working Group on State Standard for Social Science
		discipline group
17	Narek Manukyan	Education Expert, Member of the MoESC Working
1 /	Traick Wallakyall	Group on State Standard for Social Science discipline
		group
18	Ruzanna Tsaturyan	Education Expert/Researcher at the Institute of
	12020010	Archaeology and Ethnography, National Academy of
		Sciences of Armenia
19	Nvard Manasyan	Education Expert
20	Avetik Mezhlumyan	Presidents, Institute of Public Policy
21	Arevik Anapiosyan	Education Expert, former Deputy Minister of Education
22	Zaruhi Hambardzumyan	Coordinator of Debate Clubs, Jinishyan Memorial
L		Foundation
23	Lilit Hakobyan	Coordinator of Civic Education Component/ Children
		of Armenia Fund
24	Satenik Mkrtchyan	Head of the committee on Education and Culture
		Yerevan Council of Elders
25	Grigor Yeritsyan	Member of the Yerevan Council of Elders and head of
		the Armenian Progressive Youth NGO

Annex 2. Interview and FG Guides

Interview Guide 1. For NA/UNDP

Goals and objectives

- What is the Center's main goal?
- What are the Center's objectives?
- What problem will the Center solve? What educational gaps will the Center fill?

Target groups

- What are the Center's target groups? Who will it function for?
- What age groups are the main target? Why? Why exactly those groups?

Educational content

- What will be some of the content pillars of the Center from which the thematic framework will derive?
- What are the mandatory topics that all the educational programs of the Center must address?
- Are there special topics for various target groups?
- How do you imagine the online component and its connection with other programs?
- What are the expected education outcomes for the following groups?
 - schoolchildren
 - students
 - junior participants of non-formal educational programs
 - senior participants of non-formal educational programs
- What must the participants of the following groups know and be competent in at the end of the program:
 - schoolchildren
 - students
 - junior participants of non-formal educational programs
 - senior participants of non-formal educational programs
- What will be the minimum and maximum durations of the educational programs offered by the Center?

Structure, functions

- Will the Center have a separate space in the premises of the NA?
- Is an auditorium or an adjoining museum section with various exhibits envisaged?
- How many permanent/full staff will the Center have? Are any relevant financial means envisaged? Where from?

- Under whose authority will the Center work? Will it have an independent status (register as a separate entity) or will it be part of the NA structure? On what legal basis will the Center operate?
- What mechanisms of cooperation are planned with the following entities?
 - Ministry of ESCS
 - Schools
 - Universities
 - NGOs
 - Diaspora organizations
- Will the Center have a separate website or will it have a section on the NA website?
- What will be the key functions of the Center?
 - Educational
 - Information
 - Research
 - Other
- How will the political impartiality of the Center be ensured?
- Will the Center publish its own materials and social science literature? How?
- How will the Parliamentary Education Unit be integrated into the general education system, taking into account the ongoing reform of the state standard for general education and the transition to the concept of formation of competences?

Sustainability

- How/by what means will the Center continue its activities?
- Will it provide paid services? What services can it provide?

Interview Guide 2. RA Ministry of ESCS

Goals and objectives of civic education

- What must be the goal of civic education (CE) in the Republic of Armenia?
- What are the objectives of civic education?
- What problem will CE solve?
- Which of these goals/objectives must the NA Parliamentary Education Unit's programs be aimed at?
- What gaps in civic education can the NA Center fill?

Target groups

- What are the NA Center's target groups? Who will it function for?
- What age groups are the main target? Why? Why exactly those groups?
- What are the needs of those groups? What are the characteristics of each of the groups?
- For the learners of what levels of formal education can the Center's educational programs be? Why?

- What target groups can be included in non-formal education programs? Why? Why exactly those groups?
- Would the Ministry like the Center to implement teacher training programs?

Educational content

- What topics of civic education can the NA Center address in case of each of the following groups?
 - schoolchildren
 - students
 - teachers
 - Junior participants of non-formal educational programs
 - Senior participants of non-formal educational programs
- Can the Center's educational programs be integrated into/complement general education curricula? If yes, by what topics and how?
- What must be some of the content pillars of the Center from which the thematic framework will derive?
- What must the participants of the following groups know and be competent in at the end of the program:
 - Schoolchildren
 - Students
 - Junior participants of non-formal educational programs
 - Senior participants of non-formal educational programs
- Are there special topics for various target groups?

Cooperation with the RA Ministry of ESCS

- What specific topics and/or programs can the Center and the Ministry cooperate on?
 How?
- What mechanisms of cooperation with the NA Center are planned for the following entities?
 - Ministry of ESCS
 - Schools
 - Universities
 - Other educational establishments
- Which of the following functions can the Center perform?
 - Educational
 - Information
 - Research
 - Other
- Can the Center publish its own materials and social science literature? How?
- How can the Parliamentary Education Unit be integrated into the general education system, considering the ongoing reform of the state standard for general education and the transition to the concept of formation of competences?
- What should be done in order to apply the principle of complementarity and to avoid duplication of activities of the Ministry of ESCS, schools and NA Center?

- Which unit of the Ministry of ESCS will coordinate the civic education component and cooperation with the NA Center?
- What can be the cooperation with the Institute of Education to be established in the near future?

Interview Guide 3. Experts

Civic education

- What civic education programs are there in Armenia? What topics are covered?
- When and within what subject does general education cover civic education? What are the gaps?
- What must be the goal of civic education (CE) in the Republic of Armenia?
- What are the objectives of civic education?
- What problem will CE solve?
- Which of these goals/objectives must the NA Parliamentary Education Unit's programs be aimed at?
- What gaps in civic education can the NA Center fill?

Target groups

- What are the NA Center's target groups? Who will it function for?
- What age groups are the main target? Why? Why exactly those groups?
- What are the needs of those groups? What are the characteristics of each of the groups?
- For the learners of what levels of formal education can the Center's educational programs be? Why?
- What target groups can be included in non-formal education programs? Why? Why exactly those groups?

Educational content

- What topics of civic education can the NA Center address in case of each of the following groups?
 - schoolchildren
 - students
 - teachers
 - Junior participants of non-formal educational programs
 - Senior participants of non-formal educational programs
- Can the Center's educational programs be integrated into/complement general education curricula? If yes, by what topics and how?
- What must be some of the content pillars of the Center from which the thematic framework will derive?
- What must the participants of the following groups know and be competent in at the end of the program:
 - Schoolchildren

- Students
- Junior participants of non-formal educational programs
- Senior participants of non-formal educational programs
- Are there special topics for various target groups?

Cooperation with the Ministry of ESCS

- What topics and mechanisms of cooperation with the NA Center are planned for the following entities?
 - Ministry of ESCS
 - Schools
 - Universities
 - Other educational establishments
 - NGOs
- Which of the following functions can the Center perform?
 - Educational
 - Information
 - Research
 - Other
- How can the Parliamentary Education Unit be integrated into the general education system, taking into account the ongoing reform of the state standard for general education and the transition to the concept of formation of competences?

Focus group guide for teachers

- What topics of Civic Education (CE) are covered within the Social Science subject? What are the students having the most difficulty with?
- In your opinion, what should the NA Parliamentary Education Unit do?
- Can the Center's educational programs be part of the general education curriculum, and if so, how?
- What peculiarities and challenges should be taken into account when designing the educational program of the Center?
- What should be the key topics of the Center's educational content?
- What topics of civic education can the NA Center address in case of each of the following groups?
 - schoolchildren
 - students
 - teachers
 - Junior participants of non-formal educational programs
 - Senior participants of non-formal educational programs
- What must the participants of the following groups know and be competent in at the end of the program:
 - Schoolchildren
 - Students

DRAFT

- Junior participants of non-formal educational programs
- Senior participants of non-formal educational programs
- Are there special topics for various target groups?
- How can teachers cooperate with the Center?
- What needs do you have that can be met by the Center's educational programs?

Annex 3. Websites of Parliamentary education centers/resources

US Congress Visitor Center https://www.visitthecapitol.gov/

German Bundestag's Visitor Center https://www.bundestag.de/en/visittheBundestag

Parliament of Canada

https://lop.parl.ca/About/Parliament/Education/teachers-institute-e.html

UK Parliament

https://learning.parliament.uk/

UP Parliament week

https://www.ukparliamentweek.org/en/about/?utm_campaign=0620-mar-ee-ukpw20&utm_medium=referral&utm_source=ukparliament

Scottish Parliament

https://www.parliament.scot/visitandlearn/education.aspx

Parliament of Sweden

https://www.riksdagen.se/en/visit-the-riksdag/

DRAFT

Annex 4. Represenatived of Parliamentary Education Pprograms interviewed

Name	Organization	Position	
Mr. Jan H. Fahlbusch	Deutscher Bundestag	Head of Youth Programs of	
		Visitor Service	
Mr. Benoit Morin	Library of Parliament of	Senior Director of the Public	
	Canada	Education Programs	
Ms. Wendy Speller	UK Parliament	Executive Support Officer,	
		Participation	
		-	
Ms. Kristina Dahlberg	Parliament of Sweden	Coordinator of the educational	
		activities	

Annex 5. Interview Guide for the Representatives of Parliamentary Education Programs in the Selected Parliament

1. Organizational Structure and Institutional Setup

- a) What is the institutional setup of your Center?
- b) Where does it fit in the structure of the Parliament?
- c) Do you have a separate legal status/are a separate registered entity or is the center part of the Parliament?
- d) Do you occupy specific space within the parliament building? If yes, how big is it: how many rooms of which how many are office rooms?
- e) What is the organizational structure of your Center?
- f) What is the staffing of the center including full and part time employees?

2. Program and Curriculum

- 2.1. Who designs and who approves the curriculum?
- a) How is the implementation of the program organized?
- b) Does the staff of the parliament implement it or do you recruit experts for specific projects and/or outsource anything and how exactly is this done?
- c) Do MPs have any engagement or obligations towards the center/unit?
- d) What are the main programs you are running?
- e) What is the focus of the curriculum? Is it focused on parliamentary development or do you also teach human rights/history/civic activism?
- f) What are the main target groups the programs are designed for?
- g) Are those of your educational programs that are for schools synergized with the school curriculum?

3. Funding, Sustainability, etc.

- a) What percent of the Parliament budget is allocated for the center?
- b) What other sources of funding do you have?
- c) How many new programs do you do every year?
- d) How many visitors do you have annually?
- e) Any lessons learnt or success stories?

Annex 6. Job descriptions for the PEU staff members

- 1. **PEU Director/Manager** is responsible for the organization of the Center's activity, the development and implementation of the Center's strategy realization and development prospects, as well as the Center's external positioning and cooperation with partners.
- 2. **PEU Educational Programs Officer** will carry out the development, introduction, monitoring and improvement of educational programs, as well as the training of guides and animators.
- 3. **PEU research programs and educational resources officer** will organize the collection of resources, organization of research activities and coordination of the database of materials.
- 4. **PEU online and distance programs officer** will coordinate the development and implementation of the Center's online platform, organization of distance education programs.
- 5. **Assistant** will provide technical assistance during the implementation of the Center's programs.
- 6. **Contractual staff (guides and animators)** will be the main communicators with the visitors, will help go through the educational components of the Center, will carry out guided tours in the premises of the National Assembly and together with the teachers will implement interactive educational programs.