



Preparing Analysis Plans to Guide Policy Research

Raymond Struyk

Definition of an Analysis Plan

After the issue to analyze is defined and the sources of information initially identified, a step-by-step plan for using your data to test hypotheses or otherwise analyze a problem leading to policy recommendations.

Typical (incomplete) Sequence for Executing a Policy Research Project

1. Define issue
2. Identify data—including drafting sampling plan and questionnaires if needed
3. Gather data
4. Conduct analysis
5. Write report

Analytic Sequence

1. Define issue, including stating hypotheses
2. Literature review
3. Identify data—including drafting sampling plan and questionnaires if needed
4. Draft analytic plan—define variables and analytic methods
5. Revise data acquisition plan
6. Gather data
7. Conduct analysis using the analytic plan
8. Write report

Why review the literature?

- Ideas and guidance on structuring the research questions;
- understanding broader context;
- seeing how others approached the analysis; specific methods, statistical techniques
- preparing the analysis at a quality level that meets rigorous review by others.

www.scholar.google.com

An analysis plan is...

- A roadmap
- Step-by-step plan for systematically and rigorously addressing an issue

An Iterative Process

After the issue to be studied and hypotheses are identified

- Identify data required—including drafting sampling plan and questionnaires if surveys are to be done. *Be clear on the source of each data item*
- Draft analytic plan—define variables and analytic methods
 - Variables = data, possibly transformed for this analysis (numbers recoded into interval groups)
- *Draft write-up of issues being analyzed and description of analysis to be done*
- Identify data gaps
- If needed, revise data acquisition plan and perhaps the analytic plan

Two Generally Used Approaches to Structuring Policy Analysis of an Issue *--The Critical First Element--*

Log Frame or Logical Framework

Traditional Approach used extensively for defining work program and tracking progress in project execution. Many variations developed over the years.

Theory of Change Approach

Greater emphasis on linking the implementing actions of a program with attaining its goals

Currently more popular

Will explore use of both methods

**Case Study:
Client Satisfaction with
Intake in Russia's Housing
Allowance Program**

Why Does Client Satisfaction in a Public Service Program Matter?

- Program credibility
- Impact on participation rates—direct and indirect
- From a broader perspective, this is a service aspect that has received little attention in the region.

HA Program Basics

- Started in 1994; Means-tested
- Essentially all tenure groups are now eligible to participate
- Local agencies responsible for administration: practices differ widely, which can influence participation rates.

The Program - 2

- Program uses direct means testing
- Benefit formula
 - $P = MSR - tY$
 - P is payment
 - MSR is rent and communal service fees for a unit appropriate for this household
 - t is the share of income the household can reasonably spend on housing
 - Y is household income

Log Frame Key Elements

Objectives: Local HAOs provide efficient enrollment services; clients satisfied with experience

Broad questions addressed

- How do clients in different locations rate their experience?
- What explains the ratings, e.g., waiting time to see an intake worker?
- What explains differences in performance among agencies?

Log Frame for Russian Housing Allowance Program Client Satisfaction Study-1

Program Objective	Activity to Study	Indicator	Data Source
Local HAO (Housing Allowance Office) provides efficient enrollment services to program applicants Clients are satisfied with experience	1. Ease of visiting the HAO (Housing Allowance Office)	Does HAO make appointments for visits? Convenient location?	Visit to office Check public transit access.
	2. Readiness of applicants when they arrive at the HAO to apply	Information on the documents applicants should bring with them readily available?	Visit office: Info easily gotten?
		--Explanatory materials easily available at HAO?	Visit to office
		--HAO periodically runs ads in local newspaper or on TV?	HAO & local media visits
		How many times does a client visit the HAO office before having all required documents?	Survey of applicants

Log Frame for Russian Housing Allowance Program Client Satisfaction Study-2

Program Objective	Activity to study	Indicator	Data Source
	3. Effort required to assemble information required in the application.	--Time applicants spent to assemble the documents demanded by HAO?	Survey of applicants
Local HAO (Housing Allowance Office) provides efficient enrollment services to program applicants		--Number of offices the applicant has to visit to obtain documents?	Survey of applicants
Clients are satisfied with experience	4. Visit experience	--convenience of applying. HAO open hours? Days per week?	Visit to office
		--time spent waiting to be seen?	Survey of applicants
		--number of different officials met with?	Survey of applicants
		--total time spent seeing all officials on all visits?	Survey off applicants

Data Assembled

- Data for 5 cities from several rather different regions.
- Information gathered
 - Program parameters (MSR, t); changes in recent years which effects the generosity of the benefits
 - Information on HAOs' administrative practices
 - Random survey of households in service area to learn about knowledge of the program, eligibility to participate, program reputation. Essential to estimate participation rates.
 - Supplemental questions for program participants

Conclusions

- Discouraging results
 - Average of 3 hours waiting for 28 minutes with intake worker
 - Impressive variation across cities
- Must have been effecting participation: low nationally at ~13 percent
- Obvious need for setting standards and oversight by Regional governments & related training

Log-Frame Exercise

Assessing the Reform of Bus Tariffs in Szaboz, Hungary

Class Exercise

Szaboz Bus Benefit for the Elderly

- Traditionally elderly rode the bus free at all times. Benefits were unevenly distributed because of limited bus routes and difficulty of frail elderly to use the system.
- City paid the bus company \$14 for each elderly person per year assuming 24 trips (12 round trips) a month priced at \$.05 each.
- The new mayor “cashes out” the benefit, ending free services and giving each elderly person a payment of \$12 per year. City saves money. Elderly get more choices. Those taking fewer trips have more income.
- Average taxi fares are \$.10.

Your Assignment

- After six months of the new system's operations, you are tasked with evaluating how *the elderly have benefited or not* under the change.
- You have a budget to do surveys and a letter from the mayor to the bus company to provide any data you need.
- You begin your work by constructing a log frame.

Task Organization

- Some hints for identifying relevant effects. Consider impacts on elderly with adequate income and those without; who live near a bus stop and do not; who have limited ability to walk any distance versus others; whether they have been getting rides from family members or others sometimes.
- There can be multiple indicators for each
- Logistics
 - Trainees have been assigned to groups and should go to their assigned Zoom room. You need to select a leader and identify who will make the presentation if your group is called upon
 - Use the form provided in folder for “Analysis Plans: in-class charts,” that you downloaded from: the project website
 - You have 25 minutes – get to know each other; do assignment; select a spokesperson.
 - 2 teams will present their work for 10 minutes each, followed by 5-10 minutes of discussion by two other teams.

Log Frame for Szaboz Transportation Assistance Program for the Elderly

Objective	Indicators
Improved quality of life of elderly thru more flexible transportation options	
Improved travel experience	
1. Preferred types of transportation used	
2. Problems with services under new arrangement	
Income assistance to elderly	
<i>Context information</i>	[Needed for analysis to understand patterns observed]

Log Frame for Szaboz Transportation Assistance Program for the Elderly

Objective	Phenomenon to be Measured/Indicators
Permit elderly to travel as needed	Increase in number of trips made
Improved travel experience	Additional locations visited; greater sense of freedom of movement
1. Preferred types of transportation used	Taxis and Uber now used in addition to bus; less use of family members providing services; in general, change in modal choice
2. Problems with services under new arrangement	Household members less willing to provide rides. Challenges ordering taxis and Uber
Income assistance to low-income elderly	Able to save some of the money in the subsidy payment to use for food, others
Context information	Access to bus service—distance to closest stop; whether route(s) serve areas of greatest interest for the respondent; physical challenges to using a bus; household composition; presence of car.

Theory of Change Approach

- What is this theory?

The theory explains the process of change by outlining causal links to an objective in an initiative, i.e., its shorter-term, intermediate, and longer-term outcomes.

The identified changes can be mapped – as the "outcomes pathway" – showing each outcome in logical relationship to all the others, as well as chronological flow.

Theory of Change Charts

Go to the folder for “in class charts” and then to the file “theory of change chart v2.”

The chart, for an actual program, is on two pages. Good example to use as a model in constructing your own.

Before going to the chart, recall the distinctions between outputs and outcomes.

Theory of Change Example: The Transparency and Accountability Project (TAP)

- TAP was a 5-year capacity building program to strengthen policy-oriented CSOs in 15 low- and moderate-income countries to monitor government budgeting and expenditure performance primarily in social sectors.
- It included working with local partners to strengthen their analytic work and to build-up communication capabilities and relations with government officials.
- Each partner defined 2 specific policy change goals which were the focus of the technical assistance to partners
 - Look at the first page of the Theory of Change Chart *that is in the folder “Analysis Plan-in class charts,” file, “Theory of Change V2”*
 - In the chart, **IMO stands for Independent Monitoring Organization**

Column Headings in the Chart Showing Change Relations

1. Program activities
2. Intermediate outcomes expected or realized from the activities
3. Indicators of intermediate outcomes achieved
4. Ultimate outcomes

Theory of Change Chart-continued

- Primary focus in this discussion is on the part of the project measuring the impact of the capacity building measures.
- See section on Technical Assistance on p.2. Read it now.
 - Two clear goals are
 - increased IMO's analytic capabilities and
 - communications capacities strengthened and have a greater impact on policy change.
- The approach actually use to measure improvements is quite innovative and worth discussing.

Measuring Change in Key Areas— Research Quality and Communications Effectiveness

- Outputs vs. outcomes
- **Question to the Class:** how to measure outcomes of capacity building activities in these two areas?
- Hand up if you have an idea for outcomes
- OK to say how your organization measures effectiveness in either area

Measuring Change in Key Areas— Creative Indicators

1. Quality of analytic work

- The impact of workshops and mentoring on analytic projects should be reflected in the quality of reports produced.
- Qualified experts rated 6 reports prepared the year before the project and selected by each CSO as among their best and then 6 more selected in the first 6-12 months after the trainings.
- Experts, selected for their knowledge of the CSO's priority areas, used a standard scoring protocol with 3 sections to rate report quality: policy problem definition (including whether the relevant literature was used in defining issue); technical quality of analysis and reporting; and the quality of the policy recommendations.
- Results of comparing old and new reports was that the new ones were stronger and the difference in scores was statistically significant.

Creative Indicators-2

2. Perceived influence on policy decisions

--The Policy Community Survey was created and used as the interview guide for about 40 respondents in each country where the program operated.

--Respondents were identified by knowledgeable local experts working in the policy community.

--Respondents were think tanks experts, involved media, senior government officials with responsibilities in the area where the IMO worked, MPs, CSO representatives, involved media.

--Surveys conducted at baseline and after 18 months. Results are in the folder for supplemental materials. Clearly demonstrate effectiveness and improvement.

Improvement in CSO Policy Arena Performance Associated with TAP

Area rated	% respondents rating as improved over period
<i>General effectiveness</i>	
Organization focuses on high priority issues	51
Organization is a valuable source of research, including data and statistics	62
Organization's policy recommendations are helpful	62
Organization's work positively impacts public policy or administration	50
<i>Transparency and accountability issues</i>	
Organization has influence on the budget making process in terms of openness, quality or equity of budget choices	36
Organization has an impact on holding the government accountable for public expenditure quality	35

Properly Exploiting the Data You Have Assembled

- In the foregoing a lot of emphasis on defining indicators and (implicitly) determining how to obtain data to quantify them.
- When you are satisfied with the development of your plan, now is the time to check that you will actually collect the data you need for your analysis.
- Specify in detail the analyses you plan to do and check against the data being gathered. Is data on all variables being gathered?

Verification: Data Requirements Vary with the Type of Analysis to be Done

- The number of data items you need varies with the type of analysis you will do. More sophisticated analysis will require more data.
 - Bi-variate analysis (involving two variables) is simple, although you may want to examine pairs of variables
 - Multivariate analysis, such as regression, often requires many variables. Regression models often have many possible “control” variables
- *Absolutely important* to draft survey instruments now so that you can compare the list of variables with information to be collected in the surveys. Easy to leave out an important variable which can undermine the analytical results.

Homework Assignment

Each consortium

- Prepare a Theory of Change analysis for your EPF project to the extent that you can now.
- Be ready to make a 20 minute presentation on it. This will require only a very brief introductory statement on your project. Focus on the analysis plan. **Use the theory of change 4 column table format.**
- There will then be a 10-15 minute class discussion led by one Consortium.
- We will reconvene on February 22.
- Submit your chart (theory of change) to EPF **three** days before the next class so that it can be shared with other Consortiums and translated for Ray.

Presentation Schedule: Times

Consortium	Presentation Time	Discussion Time
1.	4:10 – 4:30	4:30-4:45
2.	4:45-5:05	5:05-5:20
3.	5:20-5:40	5:40-5:55
15 minute break	5:55-6:10	
4.	6:10-6:30	6:30-6:45
5.	6:45-7:05	7:05-7:20

Discussion Assignments

Presenter	Commentor
Labor Rights	Gov Spending
Socio-Eco	Mental Health
Gov Spending	Public Security
Mental Health	Labor Rights
Public Security	Socio-eco

In Conclusion: As a manager...

- Encourage your team leaders to prepare a strong analysis plan for each project
- Review plans to be sure nothing key is omitted:
 - Hypotheses on what accounts for observed situation
 - Data needed to test the hypotheses
 - Appropriate methods proposed.



Տնային աշխատանք/Home work. փետրվարի/February 15-22, ներկայացնել հետևյալ հասցեներով/to be sent to:

Ռեյ Սթրայք/Ray Struyk, PhD: struyk33@hotmail.com,

Արմեն Վարոսյան/Armen Varosyan avarosyan@urbanfoundation.am,
+37493707039

Հաջորդ աշխատաժողով/Next Workshop - Աշխատաժողով 5 - Workshop 5

15-ը փետրվարի, ժամը 16:00-18:00/February 15, 4pm – 6pm

Բանախոս՝ Դոկտոր Ռեյմոնդ Սթրայք - Speaker: Ray Struyk, Ph.D

Օժանդակ նյութեր և ձևաթղթեր /Supporting materials and forms:

<https://urbanfoundation.am/language/hy/international-technical-assistance-for-data-program-armenia-2/>

This event is made possible by the generous support of the American People through the United States Agency for International Development (USAID). The ideas expressed during the event are the sole responsibility of authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of USAID or the United States Government.